Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment

An Annotated Bibliography

Edited by
Sara Lardinois, Ana Paula Arato Gonçalves,
Laura Matarese, and Susan Macdonald

The Getty Conservation Institute

Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment

An Annotated Bibliography

Edited by

Sara Lardinois, Ana Paula Arato Gonçalves,
Laura Matarese, and Susan Macdonald

THE GETTY CONSERVATION INSTITUTE
LOS ANGELES

The Getty Conservation Institute works to advance conservation practice in the visual arts, broadly interpreted to include objects, collections, architecture, and sites. It serves the conservation community through scientific research, education and training, model field projects, and the broad dissemination of the results of both its own work and the work of others in the field. And in all its endeavors, it focuses on the creation and dissemination of knowledge that will benefit professionals and organizations responsible for the conservation of the world's cultural heritage.

Front Cover:
City Hall Extension, Murcia, Spain, designed by Rafael Moneo (1991–98)
Photo: © Michael Moran/OTTO

Contents

Introduction to the Annotated Bibliography

The Getty Conservation Institute's (GCI) Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment (CAHE) project is addressing one of the critical issues in heritage conservation—the management of change—by exploring the role of contemporary architecture in historic environments and developing methodologies and criteria for designing new buildings that are respectful of their historic contexts, and for assessing the impacts of these new constructions. The ultimate objective is to improve the quality of new architectural interventions. CAHE is working with the professional community, including the planning, architecture, conservation, and development sectors, to develop objective standards that will form the basis of guidance and assessment tools that can assist in achieving a shared understanding of appropriate development in historic contexts, improve consistency in the decision-making process across a wide range of situations, and promote good design.

As a first step in the project, the GCI carried out research and prepared this subject bibliography. *Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment: An Annotated Bibliography* seeks to identify the wide range of views within the various professional communities working in the field as to what constitutes appropriate new development within a historic area and the existing methodologies and tools already in use to guide and assess such developments, including policy documents and design guidelines. This bibliography is intended to be a resource for policy makers, decision makers, and practitioners working on the planning, design, and assessment of new architectural insertions in historic environments; it will also be used to identify any gaps in knowledge and inform the development of future tools by the GCI.

Scope and Selection of Texts

The bibliography focuses on literature that specifically addresses the topic of contemporary architecture in historic environments and, as such, does not include the broad spectrum of general literature on conservation theory and practice. This is not to say that the conservation principles espoused in these texts do not apply to the issue of contemporary architecture in historic environments; rather, in most cases, they constitute the backbone that sustains specific recommendations on this topic. It is recommended that general conservation literature be studied in parallel with the titles included here.

The selected texts concentrate on the insertion of contemporary or new architecture, particularly buildings, in historic environments. While other types of interventions, including public space improvements such as new plazas or street furniture, or infrastructure such as bridges, may also significantly impact the historic environment, the current version of the bibliography is generally limited to

1

Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment: An Annotated Bibliography - Getty Conservation Institute - 2015

texts focused on buildings. Future versions may expand on the range of intervention typologies. The selected texts focus on new, freestanding buildings in historic environments, rather than on additions to historic buildings. Some titles related to additions are included, as many of the same arguments and approaches apply to the insertion of new architecture in historic cities or settings, which are essentially additions to a larger historic resource or district.

Within this bibliography, the term *historic environment* is considered to denote urban or rural places with heritage values. Historic environments comprise ensembles of buildings, streetscapes, and/or landscapes. Most of the included texts specifically address historic *urban* environments—entire cities, towns, or villages, or designated historic districts within them, though a few refer to regional historic areas, rural landscapes, or other types of open landscapes. The texts target historic environments that carry international, national, or local historic designations.

The bibliography is based on database searches of literature prepared by planning, architecture, conservation, and development professionals, as well as on website searches and direct communications with organizations and governmental and nongovernmental agencies working in this area, all carried out between 2011 and 2014. After reviewing the results of this search, the project team used editorial judgment to select only those titles that (1) fit within one of the subject categories described below; (2) are concerned with the conservation of the historic environment, whether advocating for new buildings that replicate or stand in juxtaposition to the existing context; and (3) present a range of arguments and solutions on this subject. Most of the literature dates to the second half of the 20th century and early part of the 21st century, reflecting the rapid transformation of the urban landscape resulting from the advent of modernism and unparalleled urban population growth and economic pressures. A few key earlier titles have also been included.

Texts of international, regional, and national significance are listed, while highly localized texts are omitted except as select examples of design guidelines. The bibliography is focused on English-language literature texts and does reflect a distinct Euro-American bias; as such, it cannot be considered fully comprehensive at the global level.

Organization

Bibliographic references fall into two major subject categories: heritage conservation policies and the resulting design control methodologies (chapters 1 and 2), and design approaches and philosophies, with supporting case studies (chapters 3 and 4). The body of the bibliography is organized into four chapters, with a total of seven subject categories. These chapters, with a summary of the subjects they cover, are as follows:

Chapter 1: Conservation Policy

1.1: International Instruments
This subject category includes various international instruments—recommendations, declarations, charters, and other documents—that have been written by groups of experts on the conservation of historic environments and, more specifically, on the integration of contemporary architecture in an urban context. In some cases, documents have been developed by intergovernmental organizations such as

the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). In other cases, documents have been developed by nongovernmental organizations—mainly the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS)—which are well recognized for their high level of expertise and have been frequently sought out by government agencies for guidance on conservation issues. Additionally, some of these instruments have been prepared by regional organizations such as the Council of Europe. With the exception of conventions, these international instruments do not constitute law; rather, they are recommendations, declarations, and doctrinal texts that establish a guiding philosophy, provide practical guidance, or make a moral statement or political commitment to a particular aspect of conservation.

The majority of documents listed in this chapter are not solely dedicated to the issue of the integration of contemporary architecture in the historic environment. Most of them have a broader focus: general issues in the preservation of the historic urban environment, or, even more comprehensively, issues in the preservation of all types of historic places. The annotations call attention to specific sections of the documents that have a direct relation to the main subject of this bibliography.

1.2: National Conservation Policy Documents
The national conservation policy documents in this subject category include policies and best-practice guidance developed based on federal, state, or local legislative requirements, and often build on or respond to those international instruments included in section 1.1.

1.3: Conservation Policy Methodology and Critique
This subject category comprises publications that have been written with the intent of analyzing and improving existing conservation policies or creating new policies concerning the appropriate integration of contemporary architecture in historic environments. While some of these publications criticize existing policies, others identify current issues in planning, architecture, and construction that may benefit from the development of new policies.

A wide variety of topics and policies are discussed within this subject category. The regeneration of historic areas using iconic buildings, also known as the "Bilbao effect" or "starchitecture," and its impact on the heritage values of the place and the local communities are much discussed, as is the need for policies to respond to these phenomena. Texts often comment on the need for greater integration of conservation policies in urban and regional planning efforts. The lack of conservation policies regarding the impact of new insertions on the intangible values in historic environments is also addressed. Some texts present methodologies for identifying, designating, and managing historic urban resources.

A large percentage of the texts in this section were prepared in the time period after the Vienna Memorandum (2005), during the development of the historic urban landscape approach, which was formalized in the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011).

Chapter 2: Design Control and Regulation

2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique
The publications grouped in this subject category evaluate the effectiveness of design control methodologies—including design guidelines and design review and

approval processes—used for new constructions in historic environments. Some publications simply explain how design review processes work. A number of authors analyze existing guideline tools by evaluating their successes or failures in ensuring high-quality designs that are compatible with the historic context, sometimes providing a comparative analysis of different tools already in use. Other authors question the usefulness of existing tools and propose improved or alternative approaches. Some texts focus specifically on the topic of evaluating proposals for tall buildings in historic environments. It is important to note that the authors interested in this subject, such as architects, preservationists, and urban designers, come from different backgrounds and thus provide a wide range of perspectives on the subject.

2.2: Select Design Guideline Examples
The titles in this subject category provide a range of examples of design guidelines in use in several countries. An attempt was made to select guidelines with a diverse geographic spread, in recognition of the variation among local cultures and conservation approaches that influence each set of design guidelines; however, as guidelines are typically distributed and published only at the local level, the search for examples was limited by what was more widely available online.

Guidelines are typically developed to help apply general conservation policies to specific projects, and they differ from policy documents in that they directly influence the built form. They may be legislative or advisory in nature. Most of the guidelines included in this bibliography have been developed or commissioned by local government agencies to guide their design review agencies' evaluations of proposals for new constructions in historic environments or the wider urban environment. In addition, these guidelines clarify the approval criteria to developers and architects, with the intention of encouraging new building proposals that are respectful of the values and specific character of the historic environment, as well as building consensus among all parties.

The degree of control over the design solution varies greatly among the different design guidelines. Guidelines can be prescriptive, with strict standards of compliance, or performance-based, which allows for a greater degree of interpretation by both the designer and the evaluator. While some favor the use of specific architectural styles, there is generally great variation in the criteria that will determine if a new building is compatible with its context. For example, some design guidelines limit their recommendations to proportions and scale, while others recommend specific building materials and colors. This variation is linked not only to the local culture but also to the scale of the geographic influence. For instance, guidelines that target a specific neighborhood tend to be more restrictive than those aimed at a larger region.

Chapter 3: Design Approaches and Philosophies
These texts generally attempt to address the question of how best to design in the historic environment by providing different theoretical principles, approaches, or methodologies; however, those texts prepared by conservation professionals often phrase the question differently by asking how change in the historic environment can be best accommodated. The authors in this subject category come from a variety of professions, including architecture critics, architects, preservationists, and urban planners. Several publications have been developed by government agencies

concerned with the quality of the built environment, such as the United Kingdom's Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE).

Some texts provide a methodology for designing in historic contexts, from analysis of the historic fabric to development of a design response. Many offer an analysis of the different types of relationships created between old and new buildings. In these cases, design approaches are often categorized according to the degree to which new architecture contrasts with the historic context. Although category names vary greatly among authors, all authors agree that the opposite extremes are constituted by replication of the local historic style(s) and adoption of a contemporary architectural language that contrasts with the existing fabric. As expected, the main point of diversion among authors is usually what constitutes the most appropriate architectural response when building new in the historic environment. While most authors advocate for a balance between local building traditions and contemporary architecture, some give more emphasis to either contextual or contrasting architecture. Those authors advocating for contemporary or contrasting designs often base their arguments on the fact that they are part of the continuum of change in or the evolution of architectural styles that represent the spirit of the time. The approach advocated in a particular text is often deeply influenced by the historic moment when the publication was first produced and/or the affiliation of an author with a particular architectural style: for example, modernism or postmodernism.

As in chapter 1, section 1.3, this subject category includes texts that analyze the current phenomenon of "starchitecture." Rather than focusing on policy responses to this phenomenon, though, these texts address the topic more generally, providing a better understanding of the motivations for constructing these iconic buildings—primarily as catalysts for economic growth and urban regeneration—and how they impact the historic environment.

Among the publications in this category, it is common to find some that contain portions dedicated to design guidelines and case studies; however, when the main focus of the publication is design approaches or philosophies, the texts have been placed in this category rather than elsewhere.

Chapter 4: Case Studies

The publications grouped here contain one or more examples of new architectural insertions in the historic context, which typically date to the 20th or 21st century. These examples include large-scale additions to historic buildings, single infill buildings, or groups of buildings, which have been either proposed or realized in a historic, and often urban, environment. Most of the publications are dedicated to presenting and analyzing these types of projects; however, some of the case studies are found in publications dedicated to a broader subject—for example, a monograph on the work of a specific architect, which includes some projects located in historic environments. The type of publication often influences how the case study is presented and to what degree the response to the historic context is discussed. Included are several titles by architects who participated in the GCI symposium "Minding the Gap: The Role of Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment," held at the Getty Center in Los Angeles in 2013. This one-day public symposium explored the role of contemporary architecture in the historic urban environment through presentations by Thomas H. Beeby, Juergen Mayer H., Rafael Moneo, Richard Rogers, and Denise Scott Brown, as well as a discussion moderated by architecture critic Paul Goldberger. Video of the entire event can be viewed

on the GCI's website at http://www.getty.edu/conservation/publications_resources/
public_programs/conferences/minding_gap_sympos.html.

Several titles in this bibliography bridge multiple subject categories; however, they appear only within the single most relevant chapter or subject category. Where these titles occur, a note appears after the citation and annotation, indicating other subjects (and related chapters or sections) that are also addressed within the text.

Annotations

All of the citations are annotated, with the exception of the select guideline samples provided in chapter 2, section 2.2. Most annotations simply summarize those sections of the cited text that pertain to new architectural insertions in historic environments; however, some provide an analytical assessment and a few contain editorial commentary. The annotations are especially critical for subject material that is buried within texts covering a wider range of topics. Each annotation is followed by the initials of the GCI project team member who prepared it:

(S.L.)	Sara Lardinois, Project Manager
(A.P.A.G.)	Ana Paula Arato Gonçalves, Project Graduate Intern 2011–12
(M.D.)	Mesut Dinler, Project Graduate Intern 2013–14
(L.M.)	Laura Matarese, Project Graduate Intern 2014–15

Acknowledgments

The GCI project team wishes to acknowledge the assistance of Valerie Greathouse (Research Associate, GCI) and Dianne Woo (copy editor) in the preparation of this bibliography. We would also like to acknowledge the contributions of our late and greatly missed colleague Ron van Oers, who suggested several of the titles included here.

Future Steps

The GCI is soliciting input from professionals working in the field on the contents of this bibliography, with the goal of updating it in the future. We are especially interested in broadening the selection of references related to policies, guidelines, and case studies beyond the North American, European, and Australian contexts and from non-English-language publications. To help improve future versions, please email your comments and suggestions to CAHE@getty.edu.

Conservation Policy

1.1 International Instruments

Council of Europe. 1975. *Declaration of Amsterdam*. http://www.icomos.org/en/
charters-and-texts/179-articles-en-francais/ressources/
charters-and-standards/169-the-declaration-of-amsterdam

As part of the Council of Europe's European Architectural Heritage Year in
1975, many activities were held to raise public awareness of the importance of
built heritage. This declaration is one of two seminal policy documents issued
that year (the other being the European Charter of the Architectural Heritage)
addressing urban conservation issues. The Amsterdam Declaration, prepared
by the Congress on the European Architectural Heritage (October 21–25, 1975),
states that architectural conservation must become an integral part of urban and
regional planning, and calls for an integrated conservation approach involving
both local authorities and citizens that also takes social factors into
consideration.
The document emphasizes that "architectural heritage includes not only indi-
vidual buildings of exceptional quality and their surroundings, but also all areas
of towns or villages of historic or cultural interest," and that the people of
Europe have a responsibility to protect these towns and villages against "the
growing dangers with which they are threatened—neglect and decay, deliberate
demolition, incongruous new construction and excessive traffic."
On the topic of new constructions, the declaration asserts that "since the new
buildings of today will be the heritage of tomorrow, every effort must be made
to ensure that contemporary architecture is of high quality." (S.L.)

Council of Europe. 1975. *European Charter of the Architectural Heritage*. http://
www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-other-doctrinal-texts/179-articles-en-francais/
ressources/
charters-and-standards/170-european-charter-of-the-architectural-heritage

This charter is one of two seminal policy documents (the other being the
Declaration of Amsterdam) addressing urban conservation issued by the
Council of Europe during the European Architectural Heritage Year in 1975.
The charter aims to develop a common European policy for the preservation of
built heritage. It defines the nature of European architectural heritage, its impor-
tance, and threats to the heritage such as ignorance, neglect, deterioration, eco-
nomic pressures, motor traffic, inappropriate restoration, and property
speculation. The charter calls for an integrated conservation approach based on

sensitive restoration techniques, effective legislation, appropriate administrative support, and sufficient technical and financial support.

Article 7 recommends the use of "integrated conservation," where conservation is at the core of urban and regional planning and includes the preservation of both physical and social structures in historic cities. It emphasizes that "integrated conservation does not rule out the introduction of modern architecture into areas containing old buildings provided that the existing context, proportions, forms, sizes and scale are respected and traditional materials are used." (A.P.A.G., S.L.)

Council of Europe. 1985. *Convention for the Protection of the Architectural Heritage of Europe.* http://conventions.coe.int/Treaty/EN/Treaties/Html/121.htm

This convention builds on the recommendations of the Council of Europe's European Charter of the Architectural Heritage (1975) by outlining legislative measures and protections to safeguard the architectural heritage of the European states.

Article 1 notes that "architectural heritage" includes monuments, groups of buildings, and sites.

Article 4, regarding statutory protection procedures, requires each party to the convention to protect architectural heritage through legislation that "requires the submission to a competent authority of any scheme affecting a group of buildings or part thereof or a site which involves demolition of buildings, the erection of new buildings, [or] substantial alterations which impair the character of the buildings or site."

Article 9 on sanctions indicates that in cases of infringement of laws protecting architectural heritage, the authorities must respond in an adequate and relevant way. The response may "entail an obligation on the offender to demolish a newly erected building which fails to comply with the requirements or to restore a protected property to its former condition."

Article 15 on information and training states that parties shall develop public awareness of the value of conserving architectural heritage, both as elements of cultural identity and as sources of inspiration and creativity for present and future generations. (S.L., L.M.)

International Conference on Conservation "Krakow 2000." 2000. *The Charter of Krakow 2000: Principles for Conservation and Restoration of Built Heritage.* http://lecce-workshop.unile.it/Downloads/The%20Charter%20of%20Krakow%202000.pdf

This charter was prepared by participants of the International Conference on Conservation "Krakow 2000." The charter outlines 14 principles for the conservation and restoration of built heritage. It was prepared in the context of the process of European unification, the new millennium, and an increasing awareness of the plurality of heritage values in Europe. Article 6 and articles 8–10 are of particular relevance to the topic of appropriate new developments in historic environments.

Article 6 identifies that the purpose of conservation of built heritage is to maintain its authenticity and integrity. The techniques used for conservation should

be interdisciplinary in nature (article 10). Attention is required to improve our knowledge of architectural materials and techniques and ensure their appropriate continuation in the context of modern society.

Articles 8 and 9 outline the principles relating to the conservation of historic towns and villages and the conservation of landscapes, respectively. These articles broadly refer to principles relating to new insertions in the historic (urban or rural) environments. Article 8 states that towns and villages should be seen in their settings as a whole with structures, spaces, and human values that are in the process of continuous evolution and change. The components of towns and villages, including intangible values, should be safeguarded. Intervention in this context refers to "the city in its morphological, functional and structural whole, as part of its territory, its environment and surrounding landscape." The existing setting should be respected in terms of layout, massing, and distinctive characteristics. Article 9 states that landscapes, as cultural heritage, reflect the interaction between humankind, nature, and the physical environment. As such, conservation of landscapes requires an awareness and understanding of these relationships over time. It is important to understand the character of landscapes and "harmonize relevant territorial functions with essential values." (L.M.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1965. *International Charter for the Conservation and Restoration of Monuments and Sites (The Venice Charter 1964)*. 2nd International Congress of Architects and Technicians of Historic Monuments. http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/venice_e.pdf

The Venice Charter revised and expanded the principles for the conservation of historic monuments established by the Athens Charter of 1931. It laid down general principles that are applicable to different types of built heritage, including urban settings.

Article 6 advocates for the preservation of a monument's original setting by respecting the existing scale, mass, and color, noting that no new construction, demolition, or changes that alter these relationships should be allowed. Article 12 advocates that any replacement of missing parts be distinguishable from the original—so as not to falsify the artistic or historic evidence—yet also be harmonious. Article 13 condemns any additions to a historic building that compromise its interesting parts, its traditional setting, the balance of its composition, or its relationship to its setting. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1967. *The Norms of Quito (1967): Final Report of the Meeting on the Preservation and Utilization of Monuments and Sites of Artistic and Historical Value Held in Quito, Ecuador, from November 29 to December 2, 1967*. http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-texts/179-articles-en-francais/ressources/charters-and-standards/168-the-norms-of-quito

These norms were developed during the Meeting on the Preservation and Utilization of Monuments and Sites of Artistic and Historical Value, which assembled representatives from all of the Americas. The aim of this document was to make recommendations on the preservation of cultural heritage as a way of supporting economic and social development.

Under "Technical Measures," paragraph 8 lists the necessary actions for the protection of identified historic areas. Action 8d calls for regulations for areas adjacent to historic areas (thereby establishing the need for buffer zones), as well as regulations for "land use, density and volume relationship(s)." (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1972. *Resolutions of the Symposium on the Introduction of Contemporary Architecture into Ancient Groups of Buildings at the 3rd ICOMOS General Assembly (1972).* http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-texts/180-articles-en-francais/ chartes-et-normes/383-resolutions-of-the-symposium-on-the-introduction-of- contemporary-architecture-into-ancient-groups-of-buildings-at-the-3rd-icomos- general-assembly

These resolutions represent one of the earliest international policy documents to focus on the insertion of contemporary architecture in historic urban contexts. The resolutions are the result of the symposium that accompanied the 3rd General Assembly of ICOMOS, which convened in Budapest. The resolutions begin by reaffirming the importance of preserving historic building ensembles and their inherent harmony. They also recognize the inherent capacity of the historic urban fabric to adapt to changing human needs.
In "Conclusions," paragraph 2 states that contemporary architecture should employ materials of its own time without affecting the qualities of the surround-ing historic environment in terms of "mass, scale, rhythm and appearance." Paragraph 3 states that imitations should be avoided because they undermine the authenticity of historic sites. Paragraph 4 states that new uses are positive as long as they cause no harm—that is, the new uses are compatible with the his-toric site. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1973. *Resolutions of the Symposium Devoted to the Study of "The Streetscape in Historic Towns" Lausanne, Switzerland, 17th to 22nd June 1973.* http://www.international. icomos.org/publications/lausanne1973/lausanne1973-10.pdf

This document resulted from an international symposium organized by ICOMOS in 1973 on "The Streetscape in Historic Towns." The resolution rec-ognizes the importance of buildings of lesser cultural value and other urban elements, such as street furniture, in the composition of the historic urban envi-ronment. Therefore, it condemns new buildings and urban elements that are not compatible with the historic streetscape. Recognizing that the diversity of street-level activity contributes to the local character, this resolution advises that it should be preserved by maintaining the scale of allotments in the urban fabric. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1975. *The Resolutions of Bruges: Principles Governing the Rehabilitation of Historic Towns.* http:// www.international.icomos.org/publications/93towns7k.pdf

These resolutions were submitted to the international symposium organized by ICOMOS in 1975 to establish guiding principles for the rehabilitation of historic towns. This document recognizes the potential threat of new buildings that do

not follow the traditional urban pattern in historic towns. However, it also admits the necessity of allowing historic towns to adapt to the current needs of their populations. Article 9 explains how these two ideas should be reconciled. It advocates for the idea of adapting a historic town in a way that "its fabric, its structure and its history are not destroyed. If its character is to be preserved, the lay-out, density and dimensions of the town must be retained." The same article advocates for the "integration of modern architecture in old towns" in order to maintain their authenticity. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1975. *Resolutions on the International Symposium on the Conservation of Smaller Historic Towns at the 4th ICOMOS General Assembly. May 29—30, 1975.* http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-texts/180-articles-en-francais/chartes-et-normes/384-resolutions-of-the-international-symposium-on-the-conservation-of-smaller-historic-towns-at-the-4th-icomos-general-assembly

This resolution resulted from the Symposium on the Conservation of Smaller Historic Towns, which was part of the 4th General Assembly of ICOMOS. Although this document recognizes the value of the Bruges Resolutions (see entry above), these recommendations were tailored to the particularities of smaller historic towns.
Article 5, paragraph iii, recommends that new developments follow the existing scale, and respect the relationship to the landscape, the character, and dominant buildings. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1982. *Tlaxcala Declaration on the Revitalization of Small Settlements (1982): Adopted by the Third Inter-American Symposium on the Conservation of the Building Heritage devoted to the subject of "The Revitalization of Small Settlements," organized by the Mexican National Committee of ICOMOS and held in Trinidad, Tlaxcala, from 25 to 28 October 1982.* http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-texts/179-articles-en-francais/ressources/charters-and-standards/385-tlaxcala-declaration-on-the-revitalization-of-small-settlements

This declaration specifically addresses small settlements in the Americas, which are formed mainly by vernacular architecture. It concludes in paragraph 7a that the preservation of this type of settlement depends on the continuation of local architectural expression in contemporary buildings through the use of traditional building materials and techniques. If not available, a contemporary and compatible substitute can be used. Article 5 under "Recommendations" reinforces this idea of using traditional techniques while still reflecting current times. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1987. *Charter for the Conservation of Historic Towns and Urban Areas (Washington Charter 1987): Adopted by the ICOMOS General Assembly, Washington, DC, October 1987.* http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/towns_e.pdf

This charter established principles for the preservation of historic urban areas in view of the threat posed by rapid urban development.
Under "Methods and Instruments," article 10 refers to new buildings and the necessity of maintaining scale and lot size. It also recognizes that "the introduction of contemporary elements in harmony with the surroundings should not be discouraged since such features can contribute to the enrichment of an area." (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1999. *Charter on the Built Vernacular Heritage (1999): Ratified by the ICOMOS 12th General Assembly Mexico 1999.* http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/vernacular_e.pdf

This charter, ratified by the 12th ICOMOS General Assembly, recognizes the importance of preserving the built vernacular heritage and establishes specific principles that are meant to complement the Venice Charter.
Under "Principles of Conservation," article 1 recognizes that change is inevitable, and article 2 advises that contemporary interventions should be respectful of cultural values and traditional character. This idea is further developed in "Guidelines in Practice," articles 2 and 4. Article 2 calls for interventions that "maintain the integrity of the siting, the relationship to the physical and cultural landscape, and of one structure to another." Article 4 advises that any replacement materials or parts associated with alterations maintain a "consistency of expression, appearance, texture and form throughout the structure and a consistency of building materials." (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 2005. *Xi'an Declaration on the Conservation of the Setting of Heritage Structures, Sites and Areas: Adopted in Xi'an, China by the 15th General Assembly of ICOMOS on 21 October 2005*: ICOMOS. http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/xian-declaration.pdf

This document acknowledges the influence of setting on the historic values of a site. It makes recommendations for the protection of settings, which is meant to complement previously established charters that focused only on the historic site itself.
Under the recommendation to "develop planning tools and practices to conserve and manage settings," article 8 advocates for the use of impact studies prior to the implementation of any new development that may impact the significance and setting of a heritage structure, site, or area. It also recommends that these projects should not only contribute to the significance and character of the site, but also "positively interpret" it. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 2011. *The Valletta Principles for the Safeguarding and Management of Historic Cities, Towns and Urban Areas: Adopted by the 17th ICOMOS General Assembly on 28 November 2011 = Principes de la Valette pour la sauvegarde et la gestion des villes et ensembles urbains historiques: Adoptées par la 17e Assemblée générale de l'ICOMOS le 28 novembre 2011.* http://www.international.icomos.org/ Paris2011/GA2011_CIVVIH_text_EN_FR_final_20120110.pdf

These principles build on two preexisting documents: the Washington Charter (1987) and the Nairobi Recommendation (1976). The goal of this document is to establish principles for interventions in historic cities as a way of managing inevitable change. The document advocates for interventions that preserve both tangible and intangible heritage values of historic cities.

Section 2, "Aspects of Change": This section recognizes that historic urban areas are constantly changing and that, if properly managed, change can be beneficial. Article (b), "Change and the built environment," advocates that contemporary architecture must respect the local values and characteristics and should build continuity with the past while still expressing its own time. In addition, new buildings "should avoid the negative effects of drastic or excessive contrasts and of fragmentation and interruptions in the continuity of the urban fabric and space."

Section 3, "Intervention Criteria": Although these principles see change as a positive and natural phenomenon in historic urban sites, the amount and type of permissible change are limited by this section. The criteria presented here include values, quality, quantity, coherence, balance and compatibility, time, method and scientific discipline, governance, multidisciplinarity and cooperation, and cultural diversity.

Section 4, "Proposals and Strategies": Article (c), "Contemporary architecture," reinforces the idea of compatibility to the context, citing article 28 of the Nairobi Recommendation, and adds that "perspectives, views, focal points and visual corridors" should also be preserved. Article (d) concerns interventions in public spaces. (A.P.A.G.)

[For the Nairobi Recommendation, see entry below: UNESCO. 1976. *Recommendation Concerning the Safeguarding and Contemporary Role of Historic Areas (1976): Adopted at the General Conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, meeting in Nairobi at its nineteenth session, from 26 October to 30 November 1976.* For the Washington Charter, see entry above: International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1987. *Charter for the Conservation of Historic Towns and Urban Areas (Washington Charter 1987): Adopted by the ICOMOS General Assembly, Washington, DC, October 1987.*]

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and International Union of Architects (UIA). 1974. *ICOMOS-UIA—Seminar on the Integration of Modern Architecture in Old Surroundings, Kazimierz Dolny, Poland, Oct. 19, 1974.* http://www.international.icomos.org/publications/93towns7j.pdf

The resolutions produced in this seminar reflect the involvement of the International Union of Architects (UIA) by providing recommendations that are

more directly related to design practice; for example, that the criteria for evaluating the appropriateness of a proposed design should be founded on a scientific analysis of the relationship between society and historic fabric. These resolutions recognize the need for urban centers to change in order to accommodate modern life, but they advocate that such change should not be allowed to happen at the expense of local identity. Regarding the subject of new buildings in historic areas, "modern architecture, making conscious use of present day techniques, must respect the structural, aesthetic, historical and social qualities of its old surroundings and be sensitive to the local vernacular." This document concludes by reinforcing the need for collaboration between architects, town planners, and conservation professionals. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) National Committees of the Americas. 1996. *The Declaration of San Antonio: Adopted at the InterAmerican Symposium on Authenticity in the Conservation and Management of the Cultural Heritage, San Antonio, Texas, March, 1996.* http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-texts/179-articles-en-francais/ressources/charters-and-standards/188-the-declaration-of-san-antonio

This document is the result of a symposium on heritage authenticity organized and attended by the various ICOMOS national committees of the Americas. The symposium was a response to other international discussions on the same subject, such as the professional meetings that had been held in Bergen and Nara. Each section of the document explores how authenticity relates to different aspects of conservation in the context of the Americas.

Article 5, "Authenticity in Dynamic and Static Sites," classifies historic cities and landscapes as dynamic sites, meaning they were formed by a continuous and still active process of addition and adaptation. Thus, halting this additive process would compromise the significance of the place. However, any new elements in historic cities and landscapes still must be "harmonious with the character of the whole." (A.P.A.G.)

Le Corbusier. 1973. *The Athens Charter.* Translated by Anthony Eardley. New York: Grossman.

This charter resulted from the 4th International Congress of Modern Architecture (CIAM) that met in Athens in 1933. CIAM, an international organization of avant-garde architects, was devoted to the discussion and promotion of modern architecture. The 4th congress explored the theme of the "functional city" by critically examining issues of housing, recreation, transportation, work, and heritage and proposing solutions that stressed the importance of urban planning.

Of the 95 points in the charter, points 65 through 70 on "Heritage of Historic Cities" support the preservation of city layouts and building structures that express earlier cultures while allowing sufficient changes to provide a healthy environment for their inhabitants. Article 70 abolishes the use of past architecture styles for new structures in historic areas. (A.P.A.G., S.L.)

UNESCO. 1976. *Recommendation Concerning the Safeguarding and Contemporary Role of Historic Areas (1976): Adopted at the General Conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, meeting in Nairobi at its nineteenth session, from 26 October to 30 November 1976.* http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=13133&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

This document concerns the preservation of historic areas, which are defined as "groups of buildings, structures and open spaces including archaeological and paleontological sites, constituting human settlements in an urban or rural environment." It recommends a series of measures that should be implemented at the national level by the United Nations' member states.
Under "General Principles," article 4 warns against damage to historic areas caused by incompatible uses, additions, and changes. It also emphasizes the importance of designing by following the same principles that define the local character. Article 5 reinforces the need to preserve historic vistas.
Under "Safeguarding Measures," article 28 describes the appropriate procedures for designing new buildings in historic areas, which include an initial assessment of the context in order to determine the basic principles that will guide the design. This analysis shall examine dominant features, such as "the harmony of heights, colours, materials and forms, constants in the way the facades and roofs are built, the relationship between the volume of buildings and the spatial volume, as well as their average proportions and their position," with particular attention given to lot size. (A.P.A.G.)

UNESCO. 2011. *Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, including a glossary of definitions.* http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=48857&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

This recommendation continues the discussion that started with the Vienna Memorandum (2005) on appropriate principles for the conservation of historic urban landscapes in the 21st century. The document was produced in preparation for the formulation of the Valletta Principles (2011) and was meant to be universal. Therefore, the concepts presented were relevant to different cultures and forms of urban landscape, and the proposed tools were to be adapted to local contexts.
This document identifies new developments in the historic city as both a threat and an opportunity. It advocates for an approach that allows and supports development and adaptation to meet new needs and improve quality of life for the local population, but in a way that retains the values of the local heritage.
Section IV, "Tools," presents four categories of tools that should help with implementing the approach proposed by the document. These categories are: civic engagement tools, knowledge and planning tools, regulatory systems, and financial tools.
Regarding new constructions in historic urban landscapes, this document calls for action to promote harmonious integration of contemporary interventions (article 12). (A.P.A.G.)

[For the Vienna Memorandum, see entry: World Heritage Committee. 2005. *The Vienna Memorandum on "World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture:*

Managing the Historic Urban Landscape." Adopted by 29th session of the World Heritage Committee, Durban, 2005. For the Valletta Principles, see entry above: International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 2011. T*he Valletta Principles for the Safeguarding and Management of Historic Cities, Towns and Urban Areas: Adopted by the 17th ICOMOS General Assembly on 28 November 2011 = Principes de la Valette pour la sauvegarde et la gestion des villes et ensembles urbains historiques: Adoptées par la 17e Assemblée générale de l'ICOMOS le 28 novembre 2011.*]

World Heritage Committee. 2005. *The Vienna Memorandum on "World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Urban Landscape." Adopted by 29th session of the World Heritage Committee, Durban, 2005.* http://whc.unesco.org/archive/2005/whc05-15ga-inf7e.doc

The Vienna Memorandum resulted from a conference organized by the World Heritage Committee to discuss the issue of contemporary buildings in World Heritage cities. It builds on previous international charters that had a broader focus on the preservation of historic urban sites. As of 2012, this is the latest international policy document to specifically target infill construction.

In section C, "Principles and Aims," article 13 acknowledges that change is an essential part of tradition in the urban environment. Article 14 notes that the main challenge in building contemporary architecture in historic urban land-scapes is finding a balance between responding to economic needs and main-taining the historic context. This article also affirms that inserting conservation in the city's planning process is essential in solving this problem. Article 17 states that in addition to causing no harm, new interventions should add cultural value.

In section D, "Guidelines for Conservation Management," article 19 recom-mends that designs for new buildings be based on analysis of the typologies and morphologies present around the site. Article 20 further develops this recom-mendation by adding that this preparatory study should also identify the values and significance of the historic urban landscape; this article also introduces the need to perform impact studies including an analysis of the long-term effects and the sustainability of the proposed project. Article 21 advises against "all forms of pseudo-historical design" and adds that "continuity of culture through quality interventions is the ultimate goal."

In section E, "Guidelines for Urban Development," article 22 reinforces the need for "high-quality design and execution, sensitive to the cultural-historic context," and article 26 condemns projects that preserve only the facade while demolishing the rest of the building.

In section F, "Ways and Means," article 31 states that both historic and contem-porary architecture are important assets that contribute to the creation of a city's identity. (A.P.A.G.)

1.2: National Conservation Policy Documents

Australia ICOMOS. 2013. *The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, 2013*. http://australia.icomos.org/wp-content/uploads/The-Burra-Charter-2013-Adopted-31.10.2013.pdf

The Burra Charter provides best practice guidance for the conservation and management of places of cultural significance. First developed in 1979, the Burra Charter is structured by articles that outline the definitions and principles of conservation, its process, and its practice. All articles interrelate, and no one article should be read on its own. The charter can be applied to all places of cultural significance, which is defined as places with "aesthetic, historic, scientific, social or spiritual value for past, present or future generations" (article 1.2). It defines the aim of conservation as retaining the cultural significance of a place (article 2.2). The Burra Charter advocates a cautious approach, "changing as much as necessary but as little as possible" (article 3.1).

Where changes are proposed to a place of cultural significance, the charter recommends a process of assessment. The assessment should reference the statement of heritage significance and policies for managing the place. Changes such as alterations, additions, or new works, should be assessed as to their impact on the cultural significance of the place, and design modifications may be required to reduce any impacts. The charter identifies that new construction or other changes that would adversely affect the settings or relationships in a place of cultural significance are not appropriate (article 8).

Article 22 of the Burra Charter outlines the conservation principles in relation to new works. It advocates that imitation should generally be avoided and new works should respect the significance of the place through consideration of the new works' siting, scale, bulk, form, character, color, texture, and material. Specifically, the principles in relation to new works state:

- Article 22.1 New work such as additions or other changes to the *place* may be acceptable where it respects and does not distort or obscure the *cultural significance* of the place, or detract from its *interpretation* and appreciation.
- Article 22.2 New work should be readily identifiable as such, but must respect and have minimal impact on the *cultural significance* of the *place*. (L.M.)

Australia ICOMOS. 2013. *Practice Note: Burra Charter Article 22—New Work*. http://australia.icomos.org/wp-content/uploads/Practice-Note_Burra-Charter-Article-22-New-Work.pdf

In 2013, Australia ICOMOS prepared a series of practice notes to supplement and provide practical advice on aspects of the Burra Charter and its application. The practice notes are designed to be read in conjunction with the Burra Charter. This practice note discusses article 22 relating to new works in places of cultural significance. In the first (1979) version of the Burra Charter, article 22.2 stated that "new work should be readily identifiable as such," and the wording of this article was sometimes used to support new designs that did not respect the cultural significance of a place. The 2013 version of the charter

expands on the original article 22.2 by adding that new work "must respect and have minimal impact on the *cultural significance* of the *place*."

The practice note provides questions and answers in relation to common issues in the use of the article in the assessment and design of new works in historic environments. It emphasizes that new works should respect the character of the place and not overpower it. (L.M.)

Conseil des monuments et des sites du Québec, ICOMOS Canada French-Speaking Committee. 1982. *Charter for the Preservation of Quebec's Heritage (Deschambault Declaration) 1982: Adopted by the Conseil des monuments et des sites du Québec, ICOMOS Canada French-Speaking Committee, April 1982*. http://www.icomos.org/en/charters-and-other-doctrinal-texts/179-articles-en-francais/ressources/charters-and-standards/192-the-deschambault-charter

This document, based on then current international preservation charters, establishes general principles for the care of Quebec's heritage.

Article V-B views the development of historic sites as positive and necessary for their preservation, because it can reintroduce the sites into the community's daily life. Article V-C declares that the original fabric should always be preserved as much as possible and that reconstructions based on conjecture are to be avoided. Article VI-C indicates that historic sites should always be prioritized and that interventions in their surroundings must be evaluated for possible adverse effects. Article VI-D adds that contemporary additions should not copy historic properties and must be harmonious with the context in terms of "tonality, texture, proportions, pattern of filled and empty spaces, and overall composition." Article IX-A gives priority to traditional uses while respecting those needs of the local population that require the introduction of new uses. (A.P.A.G.)

English Heritage. 2008. *Conservation Principles: Policies and Guidance for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment*. http://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/conservation-principles-sustainable-management-historic-environment/

The intent of this document is to provide guidance for consistent decision making for English Heritage staff. It was also intended to inform other stakeholders on how decisions regarding heritage conservation are made by English Heritage. The approach advocated in this document is based on the definition of "conservation as a process of managing change to a significant place in its setting in ways that will best sustain its heritage values" (p. 7). These policies were developed to be applicable to all different types of heritage places. Regarding new works or alterations, it was recommended that all projects be subjected to an impact study focusing on short-term and long-term effects on heritage values of the place. The document also calls for high-quality design for any new work. In the case of proposed changes or development of a site that will have a negative impact on heritage values, it should be allowed to go forward only if it is proven that there is no other reasonable alternative and that the public benefits clearly outweigh the loss of heritage value. (A.P.A.G.)

ICOMOS Canada English-Speaking Committee. 1983. *Appleton Charter for the Protection and Enhancement of the Built Environment*. http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/appleton.pdf

This document focuses on setting concise principles to guide appropriate interventions in historic fabric. Conceptually, it is based on the Venice Charter (1964), the Burra Charter (1981), and the Deschambault Declaration (1982). This charter defines redevelopment in historic sites as the "insertion of contemporary structures or additions sympathetic to the setting." Under section C, "Principles," regarding "Additions," contemporary materials and designs are acceptable as long as they "respect and enhance the spirit of the original." In section D, "Practice," regarding "Distinguishability," additions "should be identifiable on close inspection or to the trained eye," and the ensemble should remain readable as one entity. (A.P.A.G.)

[For the Venice Charter, see entry above: International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1965. *International Charter for the Conservation and Restoration of Monuments and Sites (The Venice Charter 1964)*. 2nd International Congress of Architects and Technicians of Historic Monuments. For the Declaration of Deschambault, see entry above: Conseil des monuments et des sites du Québec, ICOMOS Canada French-Speaking Committee. 1982. *Charter for the Preservation of Quebec's Heritage (Deschambault Declaration) 1982: Adopted by the Conseil des monuments et des sites du Québec, ICOMOS Canada French-Speaking Committee, April 1982.*]

ICOMOS-New Zealand. 2010. *ICOMOS New Zealand Charter for the Conservation of Places of Cultural Heritage Value*. http://www.international.icomos.org/charters/ICOMOS_NZ_Charter_2010_FINAL_11_Oct_2010.pdf

This charter was created in order to adapt current international approaches to conservation of cultural heritage set forth by the Venice Charter (1964) to the uniqueness of New Zealand's heritage and the way its peoples relate to it. In the section "Conservation Processes and Practice," article 21, "Adaptation," concerns any alterations that are necessary to maintain or introduce a use in a historic site. It advocates compatibility of use, materials, and forms. Additions should complement but never dominate or obscure the historic fabric. They should also be as reversible as possible. (A.P.A.G.)

Ireland Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government. 2009. *Government Policy on Architecture, 2009—2015: Towards a Sustainable Future: Delivering Quality within the Built Environment*. Dublin: Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government

The central goal of these policies is to provide guidance for the improvement of Ireland's built environment, which includes the protection of the architectural heritage. Action 27 concerns the support of architectural quality through the creation of guidelines that promote the incorporation of sustainable design features in new projects and also help to evaluate the impact of large-scale buildings in historic urban areas. (A.P.A.G.)

[See entry in section 2.2 for the guidelines: Government of Ireland, Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht. 2011. *Architectural Heritage Protection: Guidelines for Planning Authorities*. Dublin: The Stationery Office.]

National Park Service, US Department of the Interior. 2001. *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings*. http://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/four-treatments/standguide/

The goal of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (The Standards) is to provide philosophical consistency for four different approaches to conservation: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, and reconstruction. The principles laid out in The Standards were created to be applicable to all types of historic resources, but the Guidelines are specific to buildings. New construction and additions are permitted under the rehabilitation approach. Rehabilitation allows some level of change to less significant features of the historic resource in order to accommodate a compatible use. Additions and new constructions are addressed in points 9 and 10 of the Standards for Rehabilitation, which state that additions and new constructions should not harm any characteristic features and that they should be differentiated from the historic fabric but also "compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." (A.P.A.G.)

New Zealand Ministry for the Environment, and Urban Design Advisory Group (N.Z.). 2005. *New Zealand Urban Design Protocol*. http://www.mfe.govt.nz/publications/urban/design-protocol-mar05/html/

The main goal of this document is to improve quality of urban developments and, consequently, quality of life in urban settlements in New Zealand. It identifies seven key qualities that every urban design project should seek: context, character, choice, connections, creativity, custodianship, and collaboration. Under the section "Context" (p. 18), it is recommended that each project be evaluated for its relationship to the surrounding area. The document recommends that "each development fits in with and enhances its surroundings." This idea is emphasized under the section "Character" (p. 19). Although the document recognizes that character is an ever-evolving aspect of the urban fabric, it recommends that new buildings be complementary to the local historic identity. (A.P.A.G.)

1.3: Conservation Policy Methodology and Critique

Bandarin, Francesco, and Ron van Oers. 2005. World heritage and contemporary architecture: Setting standards for management of the historic urban landscape. *World Heritage Review* (41): 52–55.

This article is based on discussions that took place during the conference "World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Urban Landscape," in Vienna in May 2005. The article advocates that policies for the preservation of historic urban landscapes should focus not only on the built heritage but also on the traditions of local inhabitants in order to preserve the character of the historic city. The approach favored by the authors is an integrated planning process that includes conservation. The authors argue that this type of policy should also be extended to the buffer zones between historic and nonhistoric areas in order to create a transition between protected and unprotected areas. The goal of the policy should be to create sustainable change that balances preservation and change, and to promote interventions that are based on a sound understanding of the context. (A.P.A.G.)

Cameron, Christina, and Christine Boucher, eds. 2006. *Procès-verbaux: Le patrimoine et la conservation des paysages urbains historiques: Table ronde organisée par la Chaire de recherche en patrimoine bâti, Faculté de l'aménagement, Université de Montréal = Proceedings: Heritage and the Conservation of Historic Urban Landscapes: The Vienna Memorandum: Proceedings of the Chair Round Table, 9 March 2006*. Montreal: Canada Research Chair on Built Heritage, University of Montreal. http://www.patri-moinebati.umontreal.ca/documents/Table_ronde_2008_Proces-verbaux.pdf

This publication is the proceedings of a roundtable organized by the University of Montreal to discuss the Vienna Memorandum (2005). Both conservation professionals and urban planners participated in the roundtable. The goal of the event was to provide a better understanding of the Vienna Memorandum and to critically analyze it as a tool for preservation. This document contains the papers presented by all speakers and a summary of the discussions that followed each session. The sessions were organized along four themes: the context of the Vienna Memorandum; the concept of historic urban landscapes; guidelines for the conservation of historic urban landscapes; and guidelines for the integration of contemporary architecture in historic urban landscapes. (A.P.A.G.)

City of Amsterdam. 2011. High-risers in Amsterdam: Produced on commission for the city council members for Spatial Planning and Monuments of the Municipality of Amsterdam and is supplemental to the Amsterdam 2040 Structural Vision. Available from the Municipality of Amsterdam.

This document is part of the Structural Vision Amsterdam 2040 strategy and provides details on the policy on high-rise buildings ("high-risers") in existing urban areas, including a brief section on historic environments. The document defines high-risers as buildings higher than 30 meters, or twice the height of the buildings in the immediate vicinity. The policy document outlines 10 different

urban areas that constitute a succession of expansions in the form of a belt that surrounds the old urban core of the city of Amsterdam. In addition to these 10 belts are "special areas" characterized by their historic values, with specific policies and assessment frameworks. (L.M.)

English Heritage. 2011. *Understanding Place: Conservation Area Designation, Appraisal and Management*. HELM Guides. London: English Heritage. https://content.historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/understanding-place-conservation-area/understanding-place-ca-designation-appraisal-management.pdf/

This document considers designated historic areas as assets that can contribute to the distinctiveness of the place and "inspire well designed new development." The goal of this document is to advise local authorities on the appropriate methodology for the preservation of the significance of historic areas. This methodology covers all phases of the preservation process, from designation to management. Part 3, "Effective Management," explains how to develop a local policy for managing change in historic areas while protecting the values that contribute to the significance of the area. This section brings attention to the need for all local authority departments involved with infrastructure and development proposals to recognize the importance of respecting the historical context. The proposed methodology includes the development of a management plan for each conservation area. The document includes an explanation of each section that should be part of a management plan. It recommends the inclusion of policies for management of new developments and guidelines for strategic sites. Annex 2, "National Policy," lists all national policies in the UK concerning the management of change in conservation areas. (A.P.A.G.)

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 2007. *Heritage and Metropolis in Asia and the Pacific: 2007 ICOMOS Asia and the Pacific Regional Meeting, May 29–June 1, 2007, Royal Hotel, Seoul*. Seoul: ICOMOS.

This publication is the proceedings of a conference held in Seoul in 2007. At this meeting, keynote speaker Yukio Nishimura identified uncontrolled development and inappropriate infrastructure development as the main challenges to preservation in urban settings. He analyzed the progress of international policy documents, such as the Vienna Memorandum and the Xi'an Declaration, in addressing these challenges.
Session I: The first two speakers, Natalia Turekulova (Kazakhstan) and Vasu Poshyanandana (Thailand), presented examples of development pressure in historic cities and how this pressure was (mostly unsuccessfully) dealt with at the local level in their respective countries. Song Inho (Korea) presented an example of a partially successful rehabilitation project implemented in a traditional *hanok* neighborhood in Seoul. Although the project succeeded in preserving the material integrity of the place, it failed in predicting the rapid rise in property value that resulted in the gentrification of the area and consequent loss of intangible value.
Session II: Michael Firestone (Israel) presented the rehabilitation of historic districts in Tel Aviv. In the first example, planners chose to maintain the historic landscape as a whole. However, in the second example, cultural values were

sacrificed in the name of economic development. This resulted from a conservation methodology that focused on the preservation of individual monuments instead of the landscape. For example, there were no guidelines for infill buildings. Susan Macdonald (Australia) advocated for the need to integrate preservation and planning in urban centers experiencing rapid growth. One of the key tools in controlling new development in the historic environment is a set of design guidelines. In the case of Australia, the guidelines "do not advocate one particular architectural approach or style over another—a highly contemporary approach may be as valid as a traditional approach. The guidelines stress the need to create a sympathetic relationship between old and new work."

Ron van Oers (World Heritage Centre) discussed the challenge presented by the trend of rehabilitating urban areas by the introduction of an iconic contemporary building (the "Bilbao effect"), which might negatively impact the cultural values of the place.

Session III: Sameeta Ahmed (Pakistan) and Masami Kobayashi (Japan) gave examples of how a government's unwillingness to compromise in cases of large infrastructure projects can be deleterious to a historic environment located in the path of the project. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

UNESCO. 2010. "World Heritage Cities." Special issue, *World Heritage Review* (55).

This special issue of *World Heritage Review* is dedicated to urban conservation, focusing on the need for tools to manage conservation and the need for change in the urban landscape, which is often associated with economic development projects. Articles in this issue most relevant to the topic of contemporary architecture in the historic environment include the following:

- "Revising the Approach to Urban Conservation" by Francesco Badarin (pp. 6–13): This article explains the context for the current revision of urban conservation policy. It identifies incompatible market-driven real estate developments as one of the main threats to historic cities. The author calls for new tools for the management of urban values while maintaining the continuing process of change that characterizes urban settings. According to the article, discussions on revision of urban conservation policy started with the Vienna Memorandum of 2005 and culminated in the development of the Valletta Principles in 2010. The article uses four case studies of historic cities suffering from incompatible interventions, such as urban infrastructure and new buildings.
- "Vienna: Identity, Values, Threats" by Bruno Maldoner (pp. 30–37): This article presents the case of Vienna, where guidelines were adopted to evaluate new high-rise building projects after the inscription of the city center on the World Heritage List in 2001. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

van Oers, Ron. 2006. "Preventing the Goose with the Golden Eggs from Catching Bird Flu–UNESCO's Efforts in Safeguarding the Historic Urban Landscape." Paper presented at the 42nd Congress of the International Society of City and Regional Planners (ISoCaRP) "Cities between Integration and Disintegration," Istanbul, Turkey, September 14-18, 2006." http://isocarp.org/app/uploads/2015/02/Istanbul-2006-_TXT_Ron-van-Oers.pdf

In this article, van Oers criticizes the creation of new iconic buildings in urban World Heritage Sites as a way of generating economic redevelopment of the area. The author argues that the development of a building that, by its own nature, works against the surrounding context would harm the characteristics elevating that site to World Heritage status. Consequently, it would undermine the capacity of generating economic redevelopment through an increase in tourism activities, which is a commonly observed phenomenon following World Heritage designation. As an alternative to this policy of urban redevelopment through iconic buildings, van Oers proposes the adoption of the concept of integrated conservation of historic urban areas. He explains that this concept was developed in the 1970s in response to the failure of modern urbanism and the need for reconstruction in the postwar period. Integrated conservation was a concept for urban policies related to the shift toward context-based architecture in the 1970s. The author traces the evolution of integrated conservation from the Declaration of Amsterdam (1975) until the 21st century. (A.P.A.G.)

van Oers, Ron, and Sachiko Haraguchi, eds. 2010. *Managing Historic Cities = Gérer les villes historiques*. World Heritage Papers 27. Paris: UNESCO World Heritage Centre. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0018/001896/189607m.pdf

This publication is a collection of 10 papers presented during meetings organized by UNESCO on urban conservation principles after approval of the Vienna Memorandum in 2005. In the introduction, Ron van Oers makes a critical analysis of previous international policies that addressed the preservation of historic cities in order to set the context in which the Vienna Memorandum and the papers included in this publication were created. According to van Oers, one of the main issues that supported the development of the Vienna Memorandum was the new set of factors currently causing change in historic cities. He argues that these factors had not been effectively addressed by previous policies. In general, the papers explore the concept of the Historic Urban Landscape and emphasize that conservation should take into consideration that continuous evolution is an intrinsic characteristic of urban sites. Some papers analyze current policies, such as Jukka Jokilehto's paper on international policies for the protection of historic urban landscapes. Other papers focus on methodologies for identification and management of significant values in urban areas. For example, Hal Moggridge's paper presents a methodology to identify the most significant characteristics of views in a Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) in order to protect them from new development. Of particular interest is Robert Adam's paper, which criticizes the Vienna Memorandum for perpetuating the modernist idea that new buildings should never be based on styles of previous eras. (A.P.A.G.)

Design Control and Regulation

2.1 Design Control Methodology and Critique

Al-Kodmany, Kheir, and Mir M. Ali. 2013. *The Future of the City: Tall Buildings and Urban Design*. Southampton, England: WIT Press.

This book focuses on issues related to high-rise buildings. Chapter 1, "The Logic of Vertical Density," provides an overview of the development history of high-rise buildings, the many different factors that led to their development—from population growth to increased land values—and the various arguments against their construction. Chapter 3, "The City Skyline and Visual Integration," focuses on tall buildings within historic environments. It emphasizes that contemporary cities compete to build not only the tallest but also the most iconic buildings in the world. As a result of this competition, the preservation community has been forced to reconsider its views and seek collaborative ways of integrating preservation and high-rise development. As this issue is linked to the management of change, London is presented as a case study that illustrates the conflict and negotiation processes used when constructing tall buildings in the historic urban fabric. In the second half of chapter 3, the authors focus on the impact of high-rise development on the skyline and visual integration. It presents cases from various cities, mainly in the United States but also in the United Kingdom, Spain, China, Germany, and the United Arab Emirates. Other chapters cover issues relating to economics, placemaking, the sustainability of tall buildings, development of iconic tall buildings, and quality measurement tools for design and performance. The book concludes with analyses of recent skyscrapers in various international cities. (M.D.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Beasley, Ellen. 1998. *Design and Development: Infill Housing Compatible with Historic Neighborhoods*. Preservation Information series. Washington, DC: National Trust for Historic Preservation.

This booklet, published as part of the National Trust for Historic Preservation's Preservation Information series, explains the development process for successful small-scale infill housing projects in older residential neighborhoods. The first part of the booklet describes the various steps in the preconstruction phase of an infill project: defining the project goals, researching the project site, understanding the market and neighborhood, structuring the development team and obtaining financing, writing the project program, selecting an architect, designing the project, and beginning construction. The second part of the booklet presents a case study examining four separate residential development proj-

25

Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment: An Annotated Bibliography - Getty Conservation Institute - 2015

ects on a single block in the historic Edgefield neighborhood in Nashville, Tennessee. It presents a detailed analysis of the design review process for each project from the perspectives of various participants, including novice and seasoned developers, the neighborhood group, and the local historic zoning commission. Because the case study was first presented 10 years prior to this publication, the author was able to revisit the community and understand how the review process has been refined, based in part on the lessons learned in the earlier projects and what impact those early projects had on future neighborhood development. (S.L.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Brolin, Brent C. 1980. *Architecture in Context: Fitting New Buildings with Old*. New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold.

Brolin uses a series of examples from the United States and Europe to demonstrate that design guidelines do not guarantee an appropriate design to the context. This author is aligned with the postmodern criticism of modernist architecture. He rejects the modernist idea that only a contrasting design can be considered a strong creative work, although he admits that contrast might be appropriate depending on the case. Overall, Brolin advocates for designs that create visual relationships with the surrounding buildings even when using another architectural style. He particularly emphasizes the importance of the texture created by small-scale ornaments on a facade. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 3: Design Approaches and Philosophies.

Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE). 2005. *Design Coding: Testing Its Use in England*. London: CABE. http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20110118095356/http://www.cabe.org.uk/files/design-coding.pdf

This publication, endorsed by the British government, was developed in the context of promoting sustainable communities and raising the quality of the built environment. Its philosophy is aligned with that of the New Urbanism-urban design movement in the United States, which is cited as a source of good examples. The publication is a report on the development of seven pilot projects and research conducted by CABE and English Partnerships (England's national regeneration agency). The goal was to investigate the efficiency of adopting design coding for new housing developments in improving their quality and facilitating the planning process. The term *design code* is defined as "a set of three-dimensional, site specific design rules or requirements for development" (p. 7). It is complementary to a master plan or a set of guidelines. Design codes differ from design guidelines in that they are more strongly enforced. The authors propose that this tool should be technical and style neutral and that the methodology for development of design codes should be based on the involvement of all stakeholders. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE), and English Heritage. 2007. *Guidance on Tall Buildings*. London: CABE; English Heritage. http://www.cityoflondon.gov.uk/services/environment-and-planning/planning/planning-policy/local-development-framework/Documents/Guidance%20on%20Tall%20Buildings.pdf

This publication provides guidance to local planning authorities on evaluating proposals for tall buildings. It acknowledges that "cities and their skylines evolve. In the right place, tall buildings can make positive contributions to city life.… However, by virtue of their size and prominence, such buildings can also harm the qualities that people value about a place." (p. 2) It argues for a proactive, plan-led approach to tall buildings, which identifies appropriate locations for tall buildings based upon detailed urban design studies. Such studies should consider the wider objectives of sustainable urban design and "take into account the historic context of the wider area through the use of historic characterization methods…identify opportunities where tall buildings might enhance the overall townscape [and] identify sites where the removal of past mistakes might achieve a similar outcome." It also sets out 11 criteria for evaluating tall-building proposals. Many of these criteria directly or indirectly address urban conservation issues, such as relationship to context, effect on historical context, effect on World Heritage Sites, architectural quality, and contribution to public space and facilities. Other criteria address planning considerations such as transportation, sustainability, and overall design excellence. The publication also provides an analysis of some of the existing planning policies and processes in the UK that should be taken into account when planning and designing tall buildings. Although specific to the UK, many of the principles and processes could serve as useful models for other national or regional governments. (S.L.)

Cox, Rachel S. 2002. *Design Review in Historic Districts*. Washington, DC: National Trust for Historic Preservation.

This publication explains how the design review process works and how it can be successfully implemented. It begins by laying out the legal basis for a design review process in the United States and explaining other instruments that support its use, such as historic preservation ordinances and historic resource surveys. The author argues that guidelines tailored to specific site needs are more effective and generate less conflict than generic ones. The "New Construction" section (p. 10) advises against building style recommendations. As an alternative, the author recommends formulating a list of key design elements that define local character, and encouraging construction of new buildings that relate to existing structures without copying them. The publication also includes three case studies: Charleston, South Carolina; Phoenix, Arizona; and Oysterville, Washington. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Donahoe, Stacey. 2004. "Guiding Additions to Historic Properties: A Study of Design Guidelines for Additions in Sixty-Five American Cities." Master's thesis, University of Pennsylvania. http://repository.upenn.edu/hp_theses/48/

In this thesis from the University of Pennsylvania's Graduate Program in Historic Preservation, Donahoe provides a comparative analysis of design guidelines for additions to historic structures that were in use in different cities throughout the United States. Data was collected through a survey and sent to selected Certified Local Governments (CLGs). US cities participating in the CLG program have partnerships with state and federal preservation offices and meet a number of criteria established by the National Park Service. Since the majority of the collected guidelines had been based on the Secretary of Interior's Standards, the author chose an example to analyze how the Standards had been adapted to local needs (chapter 2). Chapter 3 focuses on unique characteristics of certain guidelines that could benefit other cases. This chapter uses Linda Groat's article "Measuring the Fit of New to Old" to suggest some improvements to current guidelines. The thesis identifies the lack of periodic revisions to the guidelines as an important issue that should be addressed by most cities. (A.P.A.G.)

[See also under Chapter 3: Design Approaches and Philosophies: Groat, Linda. 1983. Measuring the fit of new to old: A checklist resulting from a study of contextualism. *Architecture: The AIA Journal* 72 (11): 58–61.]

Ghosh, Santosh, Ranajit Gupta, and Sumita Gupta, eds. 1996. *Architectural and Urban Conservation*. Calcutta: Centre for Built Environment.

This publication resulted from an international workshop held in Calcutta, December 16–18, 1994, organized by the Centre for Built Environment. Most articles included in this book talk about challenges and proposed solutions for the conservation of historic urban sites. Each article focuses on a different historic city, with all continents represented. The following articles specifically mention solutions for controlling new construction in historic urban settings:
- Bombay, India: An Approach to Heritage Conservation Policies" by Vikas Dilawari: This article compares conservation principles in India and the Western world. Dilawari presents some of the conservation concepts and tools developed in Bombay (Mumbai), including the policy for infill developments. According to the author, this policy permits the use of three different approaches to develop appropriate new buildings in historic settings. These approaches are imitation architecture, subtle architecture, and contrasting architecture. The paper argues that the choice of approach should depend on the characteristics of the site.
- "Jakarta, Indonesia" by Martono Yuwono: The author identifies the rapid surge of new development as the main challenge of urban conservation in Jakarta. The article proposes a series of actions to achieve the integration of historic preservation and city planning as a new methodology for urban conservation in Jakarta.
- "Conservation of Historic Fort Area: Thiruvananthapuram, India" by Prof. Ashalatha Thampuran, K. P. Geetha, and T. L. Shaji: This article presents a plan for the conservation of a historic neighborhood in

Thiruvananthapuram. This plan includes a section with recommendations concerning the design of new buildings.

- "Conservation in Historic Centre of Baghdad – Guidelines for Intervention" by Prof. Giorgio Lombardi: This article focuses on the conservation of the area of Rusafa. The conservation of this area applies different levels of intervention control according to a hierarchy of historic significance and level of alteration. The author identifies the conditions that make the site a good candidate for new constructions. Section 8 of this article includes design recommendations according to building typology and significance. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Gorski, Eleanor Esser. 2009. *Regulating New Construction in Historic Districts*. Washington, DC: National Trust for Historic Preservation.

This publication was written to guide preservation commissions in the US. It contains recommendations on how to conduct a design review process in order to achieve better design solutions for new constructions in historic districts. The goal is to help preservation commissions meet the challenge of balancing change and preservation. The publication presents the steps of the design review process while explaining how the commission should conduct each step. The six steps presented include: preliminary application review; review of submittal; final submittal preparation; review by local community groups; review by the commission; and a letter of approval or denial. One section is dedicated to explaining the criteria that should be used to evaluate compatibility of a proposed design. The criteria presented are: site placement; height, massing, proportion, and scale; materials; development patterns; and architectural characteristics (ornamentation and fenestration). The last section is dedicated to recommendations on resolving the most common problems with regulating new design in historic districts. (A.P.A.G.)

Greater London Authority. 2014. *Supplementary Planning Guidance: Shaping Neighbourhoods: Character and Context*. https://www.london.gov.uk/priorities/planning/publications/shaping-neighbourhoods-character-and-context

The London Plan 2011 is a planning policy document created to facilitate high-quality design and development in the city of London. The supplementary guide outlines the process of character and context appraisal as part of the development application and planning process. It is an overarching planning document that does not explicitly discuss contemporary architectural insertions in historic environments. The guide emphasizes the need to understand character and context prior to development. "Character" and "context" include a variety of urban planning attributes (physical, cultural, social, economic, perceptions, and experience) and, inherently, include historic environments and heritage values (policy 1.5).

The document emphasizes that understanding the character of a place helps guide change and how places may be developed in the future. It points out the importance of high-quality new designs but does not provide specific guidance or controls for new designs.

The plan outlines the assessment process to understand character and context. The process includes desk and site surveys and an analysis of the survey work that classifies the character of the place. The outcomes of this work include an understanding of a place's sensitivity to change and a constraints and opportunities analysis for future development and regeneration. The assessment considers the historic charter of a place in addition to sustainability, quality of design, population density, safety, and visual and physical connections to other places. The document includes several examples of constraints and opportunities analyses of existing or proposed developments in London. (L.M.)

Lira, Flaviana Barreto, and Virgínia Pontual. 2006. Is conciliation of the old and the new possible? Urbanistic instruments applied to the historical area of the downtown district of Bairro do Recife – Pernambuco. *City & Time* 2 (1): 27–46. http://www.ceci-br.org/novo/revista/docs2005/CT-2005-43.pdf

This article analyzes how planning policies can help influence harmonious solutions for new buildings in historic neighborhoods. The article was based on research conducted in Recife, Brazil, but the authors argue that the planning policies analyzed were similar to others found elsewhere in the world. Therefore, the conclusions might be helpful to professionals from other localities. The authors begin by describing the urban morphology, its formation, and the typical building typologies from Bairro do Recife, a historic district in Recife. In order to evaluate the efficacy of current planning policies in the protection of this neighborhood's character, the authors simulated various solutions to new constructions that might be permitted. The morphology study constituted the foundation for determining whether the possible solutions to infill construction were appropriate or not. Research concluded that current policies allowed new buildings that could undermine the historical character of the place. However, it also showed that it was possible to increase the built area and introduce new buildings without threatening the local character by using the morphology study as guidance. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Loew, Sebastian. 1998. *Modern Architecture in Historic Cities: Policy, Planning, and Building in Contemporary France*. London: Routledge.

In this book, Loew analyzes the factors influencing the integration of contemporary architecture in historic cities in France. The author justifies choosing France as a case study based on the frequency with which contemporary architecture buildings are inserted in historic environments and are accepted by the local people without reverting to the use of past styles or facadism. Chapter 3 describes the different control mechanisms applicable to new constructions in France. Chapter 4 analyzes case studies in five French cities where the design approval process was composed of negotiations between the parties involved in order to reach a satisfactory solution. Chapters 5 and 6 identify the parties involved in this negotiation process and analyze their contributions. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

National Park Service, US Department of the Interior. 2001. Creating and Using
    Design Guidelines. http://www.nps.gov/tps/education/workingonthepast/role-
    theyplay.htm

This webpage is part of a website created by the National Park Service on man-
agement of historic districts. It gives basic information on design guidelines,
including guidance for their development and application. The guidelines are
meant to be advisory and not mandatory like a law or an ordinance. The web-
page delineates the capabilities of this preservation instrument and recommends
the creation of local design guidelines based on the need to protect the specific
features that contribute to local character. Design guidelines should address dif-
ferent levels of intervention. The process of writing design guidelines is pre-
sented in five steps. One section is dedicated to the design review process, and
another focuses on possible challenges to the development and application of
design guidelines. (A.P.A.G.)

National Trust for Historic Preservation. 1992. *Reviewing New Construction
    Projects in Historic Areas.* Information Series 62. Washington, DC: National
    Trust for Historic Preservation.

This document was written to provide preservation commissions with basic
procedures and useful documents for a design review process. The first part
describes operational tools that should be used as a foundation for decision
making such as survey of the historic resources, preservation plan, preservation
ordinance, and design guidelines. The second part discusses the procedure for
submitting a proposal for new construction in a historic area. The third part
describes how to conduct a preservation commission meeting to evaluate and
determine the appropriateness of a proposal. The fourth, and final, part covers
how to maintain a professional standard on design reviews. (A.P.A.G.)

Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia and John Milner Associates. 1992.
    The Philadelphia Neighborhood Conservation District. Vol. 1. Philadelphia:
    Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia.

This publication proposes a new instrument to protect neighborhood character:
conservation districts. Neighborhoods that have a unique character but lack the
historic integrity or significance to become a historic district are ideal candi-
dates. The goal is to preserve the streetscape and neighborhood character
instead of individual building features. To that end, a conservation district gen-
erates rules that are more permissive than those of historic districts. A typical
characteristic of conservation districts is the development of design guidelines
that are neighborhood-specific. These guidelines are meant to complement zon-
ing regulations. The decision to adopt design guidelines is based on the desire
to make the review process more efficient and to produce a document that could
inform building permit applicants of the components of the physical character
of the neighborhood. Chapter 5 discusses the development of design guidelines
for conservation districts. (A.P.A.G.)

Punter, John. 1999. *Design Guidelines in American Cities: A Review of Design Policies and Guidance in Five West Coast Cities*. Town Planning Review Special Studies 2. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.

This book provides an overview of urban planning policies and design initiatives in five cities located along the west coast of the United States: Seattle; Portland, Oregon; San Francisco; Irvine, California; and San Diego. The chapters on Portland, San Francisco, and San Diego include analyses of guidelines used to regulate the design of new buildings in historic environments. For Portland (chapter 3), the history of preservation activities since 1988, when general historic development guidelines were prepared, are summarized. In addition, this chapter presents the decision-making process defined by those regulations. The Albina Community Plan (adopted in 1993, with full implementation expected by 2015) is presented as a case study illustrating the historic preservation aspect of urban planning in Portland. San Francisco, the first American city to develop citywide urban design policies, is the subject of chapter 4. Various city policies are presented, including the 1972 Master Plan, which introduced the first limitations on new building design; the 1985 Downtown Plan, which was prepared to manage downtown office development; and specific neighborhood guidelines for residential areas and historic commercial districts, such as the Union Street Design Guidelines. Detailed information is provided on the 1985 Downtown Plan's objectives and design policies, impact assessments, performance guidelines for open spaces, and application of transferred development rights (TDR). Chapter 6, on San Diego, explains the design content of the city's General Plan (first adopted in 1978 and later updated in 1989) and Community Plans for 40 of its 58 communities (at the time of the book's publication). The General Plan, prepared to manage urban growth, gives consideration to conservation of the city's landscape and natural features. Punter notes that community participation in the development of Community Plans is quite remarkable. Among five community plans presented, the Old Town San Diego Community Plan and the Golden Hill Community Plan address new design in historic environments. Sample pages of many of the guidelines discussed are reproduced in the book. (M.D., S.L.)

Scheer, Brenda Case, and Wolfgang F. E. Preiser, eds. 1994. *Design Review: Challenging Urban Aesthetic Control*. New York: Chapman & Hall.

This book is a result of the International Symposium on Design Review, which took place in Cincinnati in October 1992. Each chapter corresponds to a paper presented at this symposium; together, they reflect different professional backgrounds and positions regarding the effectiveness of design control instruments in promoting high-quality design. Additionally, these papers reflect experiences from various international localities. Several authors analyze the relationship between design control and preservation of historic sites. The book discusses the advantages and challenges of implementing some degree of design control, such as guidelines and design review boards. (A.P.A.G.)

Short, Michael J. 2012. *Planning for Tall Buildings*. New York: Routledge.

In this book, Short, a planner and conservation officer in the UK, examines tall buildings, analyzing their relationship to the city and the planning mechanisms used to encourage or control their development. Chapter 1 traces the evolution of the tall building, from its emergence in the United States in the late 19th century, through the impact of New York's zoning ordinances on their form, the Modern Movement, the postmodernist response, and finally the contemporary global tall-building phenomenon. Chapter 2, on the potential impact of tall buildings, looks at their effects on context, the historic environment, and local environment (microclimates and daytime and nighttime lighting), as well as issues related to transportation, permeability, and sustainability. Chapter 3 discusses the emergence of planning frameworks for tall buildings. Chapter 4, "The Conservation Challenge of Tall Buildings," focuses on the specific tools used by the conservation planning sector in England to manage tall-building proposals. Seven chapters present case studies in the UK (Liverpool, Manchester, Birmingham, and Newcastle), Ireland (Dublin), Norway (Oslo), and Canada (Vancouver), showing a range of planning approaches. The book concludes with an analysis of those planning techniques that have proven to be most effective and makes recommendations on how cities can best approach planning strategically for tall buildings in the future. (S.L.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Smith, Chris, ed. 2008. "The Old and the New." Special issue, Conservation Bulletin (59). http://www.english-heritage.org.uk/publications/conservation-bulletin-59/

This issue of English Heritage's biannual magazine is dedicated to the evaluation of urban change in the historic environment. The publication was written from the perspective of the heritage professional who is in the decision-making position to allow change or not. It is divided into four sections. Section 1, "Continuity and Innovation," contains articles that discuss how to approach the problem of balancing change and continuity, examining issues such as the pace of change in postwar England; the principles for building in a historical context established by the Prince's Foundation for the Built Environment; how opposition to innovation in the historic built environment can be overcome; and differences between inserting bold new architectural innovations in large cities, where they can be more easily accommodated, and in smaller towns and villages. Section 2, "New Understanding," has articles on how to understand and define the characteristics that contribute to the value of a place, touching on English Heritage's Conservation Principles, definitions of a historic building's "setting," and the development of policy framework to protect views. Section 3, "The Curator's Story," presents articles on how historic property stewards have dealt with the issue of designing additions, balancing visitors' needs and expectations while respecting the historic character of the site. Multiple sites managed by English Heritage and the National Trust are referenced as examples. Section 4, "Shock of the New (and Nearly New)," includes articles that analyze how the public receives change in the urban environment. The challenges of designating nearly new places, such as modern heritage, are discussed, using

Robin Hood Gardens, Peter and Alison Smithson's Brutalist residential complex in London, as a case study. Other case studies include Foster and Partners' extension of St. Pancras station in London, the redevelopment of the Rotunda in Birmingham, and Antony Gormley's *Angel of the North*, a landmark sculpture in Gateshead. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Vines, Elizabeth. 2005. *Streetwise Asia: A Practical Guide for the Conservation and Revitalisation of Heritage Cities and Towns in Asia*. Bangkok: UNESCO Bangkok.

This book was developed with the intent of guiding all stakeholders involved in planning for historic cities in Asia to incorporate heritage conservation principles into their work. The author uses both successful and unsuccessful examples to demonstrate the validity of the principles proposed. Chapter 2 presents a phase-by-phase summary of a methodology for the implementation of actions with the intent of preserving the authenticity of historic districts. This methodology is further developed in chapter 4, where the author proposes the "development of a planning framework which ensures that new development reinforces the sense of place (…)" (p. 7). This framework should reinforce characteristic elements of the streetscape and encourage the use of traditional building materials. Chapter 7 presents different ways in which legislation, or related building design guidelines, can be used to protect the historic character of urban environments. Chapter 10 is dedicated to explaining the benefits of implementing design control in new developments, which can be done through design guidelines and review boards. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

2.2: Select Design Guideline Examples

Australia

Ashfield Municipal Council. 2007. *Development Control Plan, Part C7: Haberfield Heritage Conservation Area*. Sydney: Ashfield Municipal Council.http://www.heritage.wa.gov.au/docs/lg-design-guidelines/ashfield_haberfield.pdf?sfvrsn=2

City of Sydney and Architectus Pty Ltd. 2006. *City of Sydney Heritage Development Control Plan 2006*. Sydney: City of Sydney. http://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0018/119511/ApprovedHeritageDCP2006.pdf

Helen Lardner Conservation and Design Pty Ltd. for Hobsons Bay City Council. 2006. *Guidelines for Infill Development in Heritage Areas in Hobsons Bay*. Hobsons Bay: Hobsons Bay City Council. http://www.hobsonsbay.vic.gov.au/files/7fe6ed28-ae63-4920-b4e8-9fd700b61e2e/Guidelines_for_Infill_Development_in_Heritage_Areas_in_Hobsons_Bay.pdf

Heritage Council of New South Wales and Royal Australian Institute of Architects, New South Wales Chapter. 1988. *Infill: Guidelines for the Design of Infill Buildings*. Sydney: Heritage Council of New South Wales.

———. 2005. *Design in Context: Guidelines for Infill Development in the Historic Environment*. Sydney: NSW Heritage Office.

———. 2008. *New Uses for Heritage Places: Guidelines for the Adaptation of Historic Buildings and Sites*. Parramatta: Heritage Office of NSW, NSW Department of Planning.

Woollahra Council. 2003. *Woollahra Heritage Conservation Area: Development Control Plan 2003*. Double Bay: Woollahra Municipal Council. http://www. woollahra.nsw.gov.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0013/104008/Woollahra_HCA_ DCP_Amendment_1.pdf

———. 2008. *Paddington Heritage Conservation Area Development Control Plan 2008*. Double Bay: Woollahra Municipal Council. http://www.woollahra. nsw.gov.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0014/104009/Paddington_HCA_DCP_ Amendment_1.pdf

Brazil

Ministério da Cultura República Federativa do Brasil and Instituto do Patrimônio Histórico e Artístico Nacional (IPHAN). 2010. *Portaria nº 312, de 20 de outubro de 2010: Dispõe sobre os critérios para a preservação do Conjunto Arquitetônico e Urbanístico de Ouro Preto em Minas Gerais e regulamenta as intervenções nessa área protegida em nível federal*. Brasília: Governo Federal Brasileiro. http://saojoaodelreitransparente.com.br/laws/view/47

Prefeitura Municipal de São João del Rei. 2011. *Diretrizes Políticas de Preservação do Centro Histórico de São João del-Rei*. São João del Rei: Prefeitura Municipal de São João del Rei.

Canada

City of Victoria Planning and Development Department. 2006. *Design Guidelines: Old Town, Victoria, B.C.: New Buildings and Additions to Non-heritage Buildings*. Victoria, British Columbia: City of Victoria Heritage Program. http://www.victoria.ca/assets/Departments/Planning~Development/ Development~Services/Documents/neighbourhoods-old-town-design.pdf

Ireland

Government of Ireland, Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht. 2011. *Architectural Heritage Protection: Guidelines for Planning* Authorities. Dublin: The Stationery Office. http://www.ahg.gov.ie/en/Publications/ HeritagePublications/BuiltHeritagePolicyPublications/Architectural%20 Heritage%20Protection%20Guidelines%20(2011).pdf

New Zealand

Ministry for the Environment New Zealand. 2002. *People, Places, Spaces: A Design Guide for Urban New Zealand*. Wellington: Ministry for the Environment New Zealand. http://www.mfe.govt.nz/sites/default/files/people-places-spaces-mar02.pdf

Singapore

Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA). 2011. *Conservation Guidelines*. Singapore: URA. http://www.ura.gov.sg/uol/guidelines/conservation/~/media/User%20Defined/URA%20Online/Guidelines/Conservation/Cons-Guidelines.ashx

United Kingdom

Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE) and English Heritage. 2001. *Building in Context: New Development in Historic Areas*. London: CABE and English Heritage. http://www.designcouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/asset/document/building-in-context-new-development-in-historic-areas.pdf

United States

Architectural Resources Group. 2002. *Historic Downtown Los Angeles: Design Guidelines*. San Francisco: Architectural Resources Group.

Bucks County Planning Commission. 1989. *Village Planning Handbook*. Doylestown, PA: Bucks County Planning Commission.

City of Greensboro. 2010. *Downtown Greensboro Design Manual: Process/Guidelines – Adopted September 7, 2010*. Greensboro, NC: City of Greensboro. http://www.greensboro-nc.gov/modules/showdocument.aspx?documentid=8500

City of Philadelphia. 2008. Amending Title 14 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled "Zoning and Planning," by adding a new Section 14-908, entitled "Queen Village Neighborhood Conservation District." Philadelphia Code Bill No. 080080-A. Philadelphia: City of Philadelphia. http://phila.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=1232293&GUID=BC60A7DC-F375-4C6E-B33D-AF66DA716B75&Options=ID|Text|&Search=080080-a

City of Portland, Bureau of Planning. 2008. *The Infill Design Toolkit: Medium-Density Residential Development*. Portland, OR: City of Portland, Bureau of Planning. http://www.portlandonline.com/planning/index.cfm?c=49249&a=223701

City of Seattle Pioneer Square Preservation Board. 2007. *Design Guidelines for New Construction on the North Lot in Pioneer Square*. Seattle: Historic Preservation Program, Seattle Department of Neighborhoods. http://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/neighborhoods/historicpreservation/historicdistricts/PioneerSquare/PioneerSquare-Guidelines.pdf

Hawkins, Dominique M. 2005. *Design Guidelines: A Guide for Maintaining and Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and Landscapes*. Hopewell, NJ: Hopewell Township Historic Preservation Commission. http://www.hopewelltwp.org/Historic_Guidelines_full-report.pdf

———. 2008. *Guidelines for Additions and New Construction. Gloucester City, NJ*: Urban Enterprise Zone and Historic Preservation Commission of Gloucester City. http://www.cityofgloucester.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/07_AdditionsNewConstruction_0808.pdf

———. 2009. *Design Guidelines: A Guide for Maintaining and Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*. Riverhead, NY: Town of Riverhead Landmarks Preservation Commission. http://townofriverheadny.gov/files/documents/HistoricPresDesignGuidelines.6.09.pdf

———. 2011. *City of New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Design Guidelines*. New Orleans: City of New Orleans. http://www.nola.gov/hdlc/design-guidelines/

Historic Review Commission of Pittsburgh. 1993. *Design Guidelines: East Carson Street Historic District*. Pittsburgh: City of Pittsburgh. http://apps.pittsburghpa.gov/dcp/05_East_Carson_Street_Guidelines.pdf

Hole, Donna C., Mariah McGunigle, and Rosamond H. Rice, eds. 2007. *Building in the Fourth Century: Annapolis Historic District Design Manual*. Annapolis, MD: Annapolis Historic Preservation Commission. http://www.annapolis.gov/docs/default-source/planning-and-zoning-documents/designmnl.pdf?sfvrsn=2

Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia. 2007. *Sense of Place: Design Guidelines for New Construction in Historic Districts*. Philadelphia: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia. http://www.preservation-alliance.com/publications/SenseofPlace_final.pdf

Presidio Trust. 2011. *Mid-Crissy Area Design Guidelines – December 2011, Final*. San Francisco: Presidio Trust. http://library.presidio.gov/archive/documents/MidCrissyGuideLines_120811.pdf

Raleigh Historic Districts Commission. 2012. *Design Guidelines for Raleigh Historic Districts. Section 4: Additions and New Construction*. Raleigh, NC: Raleigh Historic Districts Commission. http://www.rhdc.org/sites/default/files/RHDC-4Z.pdf

Roslyn Historic Preservation Commission. 2007. T*he City of Roslyn Standards and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction of Historic Properties*. Roslyn, WA: Roslyn Historic Preservation Commission. http://www.ci.roslyn.wa.us/departments/Standards-and-Guidelines-for-preservation.pdf

Schneider, David B., Peter Benton, Historic Preservation Trust of Lancaster County, and John Milner Associates. 1992. *Preserving Community Character: City of Lancaster, Pennsylvania*. Lancaster, PA: City of Lancaster, Department of Housing and Community Development.

Design Approaches and Philosophies

Adam, Robert, and Matthew Hardy, eds. 2008. *Tradition Today: Continuity in Architecture and Society.* Southampton, England: WIT Press.

This book is a collection of essays on the meaning of tradition in modern society. It was prepared after the inaugural conference of the International Network for Traditional Building, Architecture and Urbanism (INTBAU) in 2002. The book is broadly concerned with the concept of tradition in buildings and urbanism and discusses the rejection of tradition in the 20th century by modernism. The authors of the essays propose that tradition can be integrated into modern society and that there are a number of benefits that arise when communities reengage with tradition. Cultural traditions, such as craftsmanship and architecture, can adapt and change and are key to the transmission of culture. The INTBAU Charter recognizes that through tradition, a sense of character and identity is preserved. The authors do not specifically discuss new architectural insertions in historic environments but outline concepts of tradition and continuity—and how these concepts can be integrated rather than rejected—in current conservation approaches and in the built environment. (L.M.)

Alderson, Caroline R. 2006. Responding to context: Changing perspectives on appropriate change in historic settings. *APT Bulletin* 37 (4): 22–33.

This article analyzes the history of interventions in historic environments and identifies a shift in the approach to designing new buildings in historic contexts and additions to historic structures. This shift consists of a gradual move toward a more abstract interpretation of context characteristics and is believed to have been caused by the preservation community's acknowledgment that a high-quality design that does not mimic the extant historic style could add value to a historic site without harming its values and character-defining elements. The author explains that this contemporary design approach builds on the accumulation of historical layers in a cityscape. This new approach ensures that new buildings have a design quality that may help grant it a historic property status in the future. The article gives examples of different infill projects where each case was best solved by a different degree of abstraction in its response to the context. The examples attempt to achieve a balance between respecting the characteristics of the historic site and expressing contemporary architecture ideas. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

39

Contemporary Architecture in the Historic Environment: An Annotated Bibliography - Getty Conservation Institute - 2015

Ames, David L., and Richard D. Wagner, eds. 2009. *Design and Historic Preservation: The Challenge of Compatibility: Held at Goucher College, Baltimore, Maryland, March 14–16, 2002*. Newark: University of Delaware Press.

This book is a compilation of all papers presented at the 3rd National Forum on Preservation Practice: A Critical Look at Design in Historic Preservation. Professionals of different backgrounds, including architects, landscape architects, engineers, and historic preservationists, contributed papers covering four subjects: compatible design, design standards and guidelines, design and cultural landscapes, and design and the recent past.
In session I, each paper examines a different challenge of designing in historic environments. Session II offers examples on how strict guidelines and review boards can have a negative effect on a historic neighborhood characterized by design diversity. This session also presents cases where appropriate guidelines proved to be an important tool for preservation. Papers in session III illustrate modernist and postmodernist approaches to interventions in the historic environment. This session offers examples of contrasting designs that still manage to be respectful to the historic environment. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique.

Babalis, Dimitra, ed. 2008. *Chronocity: The Scale of Sustainable Change: Heritage Value and Future Opportunities and Challenges*. Cities, Design & Sustainability Series 5. Florence: Alinea International.

This book resulted from the 2008 LLP/Erasmus Intensive Programme Research Scholar Workshop on Chronocity, held at the University of Florence, School of Engineering. The goal of this program was to enhance quality of life in the urban environment by promoting sustainable change. Recognizing that heritage value is a strong tool for sustainable change, the book proposes a design methodology based on learning from local history and respecting local character. Part 1 focuses on explaining the issues involved in sustainable change and the current need for it. In part 2, chapter 5, "Methodology for Surveying and Evaluating Traditional Historic Settlements," Catherine Dimitsantou-Kremezi presents a methodology for the identification of the prevalent urban morphology and for understanding its development. This type of analysis is proposed as a preparatory process to guide new designs in interpreting and respecting their context. Chapter 6, "Evaluation of Built Heritage as Basis for Planning Strategy," by Helen Maistrou, proposes an approach similar to that of chapter 5 but focuses on application to urban planning. Part 3 presents examples where heritage has been successfully used in urban regeneration. Part 4 presents designs produced during the workshop by students from participating universities. (A.P.A.G.)

Babalis, Dimitra, ed. 2010. *Chronocity: The Assessment of Built Heritage for Developable and Creative Change*. Cities, Design & Sustainability Series 6. Florence: Alinea International.

This publication resulted from the second iteration of the LLP/Erasmus Intensive Programme Research Scholar Workshop on Chronocity, which took

place in 2009 at the University of Florence. It further explores the integration of heritage values and sustainable urban change. Chapters 2, 3, and 8 directly refer to interventions in heritage areas. In chapter 2, "Industrial Wastelands: Interventions and Responsibilities in Transforming Our Heritage," Irene Curulli uses examples from Italy and the Netherlands to demonstrate how intervention projects can successfully enhance local characteristics. In chapter 3, "The Industrial Heritage Values: Sustainable and Creative Change and Regeneration," Helen Maistrou discusses the limitations of sustainable change in projects where the proposed new functions require changes incompatible with maintenance of historic values. In chapter 8, "New Architectural Proposals for Architecturally Significant Settlements," Catherine Dimitsantou-Kremezi focuses on issues that should be taken into consideration when designing in a heritage area. She advocates for new buildings in the spirit of the place but without imitation of traditional forms. (A.P.A.G.)

Babalis, Dimitra, ed. 2011. *Chronocity: Sensitive Interventions in Historic Environment*. Cities, Design & Sustainability Series 7. Florence: Alinea International.

This book was based on the third LLP/Erasmus Intensive Programme Research Scholar Workshop on Chronocity. It focuses on how design can contribute to the preservation of historic areas. In the introduction, "From Sensing the Context to Making Sense of Architectural Interventions: A Working Theory," Vassilis Ganiatsas presents his theory on what constitutes a "sensitive" intervention in the historic environment and proposes a methodology to achieve it. Ganiatsas considers feature analysis of historical contexts an inappropriate tool to guide new designs for these areas. He argues that scientific analysis is based on generalizations; however, historic values often rely on the uniqueness of the site. Ganiatsas proposes "sensing" as an alternative to analyzing, defining "sensing" as "the quality of perceiving, conceiving and understanding a historic environment in its values, as we interpret them today" (p. 9). This methodology, he believes, does not prescribe a single design solution; rather, "sensing architectural heritage values enables an equally sensitive response to them either by perpetuating them in a mimetic mode or by creating a meaningful contrast towards enhancing them" (p. 9). He describes the method for translating the act of "sensing" the historical context into a "sensitive" design solution: "We sense the context, we make sense of our intended intervention, we sense back the context, as already containing our intervention and we make sense back of the new reality. Thus, we constantly adjust and refine ourselves until we sense the context in need of our intervention and our intervention as always being there" (p. 10). He defines "sensitive" intervention as "the expression of our making sense of values, of our understanding and interpretation" (p. 10). Chapters 2, 8, 14, and 16 present examples from different countries illustrating Ganiatsas's theory. (A.P.A.G.)

Byard, Paul Spencer. 1998. *The Architecture of Additions: Design and Regulation*.
New York: Norton.

In this book, the author attempts to answer the following questions: "How does
one building affect the meaning of another when their expressions are combined
and interact? How should they affect each other when one of them is protected
in the public interest?" (p. 9). Chapter 1 illustrates how successfully designed
additions can contribute to the general meaning and expression of a building.
Chapter 2 advocates that even when additions use radically different architec-
tural expressions, such as those created during the modernist period, they can
enrich the existing building. Chapter 3 analyzes contemporary examples of
additions to historic structures and strategies to protect the historic values of
the site. Chapter 4 evaluates how architects at the end of the 20th century dealt
with additions. The book includes interesting examples of additions to iconic
modern buildings such as Louis I. Kahn's Salk Institute for Biological Studies,
in La Jolla, California. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Casson, Hugh. 1976. Old sites and new buildings: The architect's point of view. In
The Future of the Past: Attitudes to Conservation 1174–1974, ed. Jane Fawcett,
150–52. New York: Whitney Library of Design.

This is a chapter in a book that analyses the evolution of how historic buildings
were preserved in the United Kingdom from the Reformation to the book's pub-
lication date. In this chapter (8), Casson warns against overpreserving an urban
landscape, arguing that a lack of restraint might weaken the case for historic
preservation. Casson defends that the addition of a new building to a historical
context could potentially become a positive contribution as long as the new
building is designed as a response to that specific context. The author does not
champion a particular approach to designing new buildings for historical con-
texts; he believes each case demands a different strategy: "The rules are simple,
for there are none. Every case is unique, every situation different.… There are
occasions for the quick return, the wise-crack, the spirited exchange between
individuals" (p. 151). Aligned with that idea, Casson does not agree with the
adoption of strict design controls by authorities. (A.P.A.G.)

Charles, Prince of Wales. 1984. A speech by HRH The Prince of Wales at the
150th anniversary of the Royal Institute of British Architects (RIBA), Royal
Gala Evening at Hampton Court Palace, May 29. http://www.audacity.org/
downloads/Prince-Charles-01-RIBA-carbuncle-29.05.84.pdf

In this speech, Charles, the Prince of Wales, challenges architects "to be con-
cerned about the way people live; about the environment they inhabit and the
kind of community that is created by that environment," urging them to design
in conjunction with and for the approval of the "mass of ordinary people in this
country," not just to please fellow architects and critics. He suggests this can be
accomplished by a return to the traditional language of architecture, which he
feels the community naturally prefers over modernism. He also argues that
modernism has "ruined" the character and skyline of historic cities such as
London. To support his case, he offers a number of unsuccessful examples of

modernist architecture, most memorably calling architect Peter Ahrends's proposal for the new Sainsbury Wing of the National Gallery in London "a monstrous carbuncle on the face of a much-loved and elegant friend." This speech eventually led to the abandonment of Ahrends's proposal in favor of a postmodern design by the firm of Venturi, Scott Brown and set off an intense debate between Prince Charles and leading British architects of the time such as Richard Rogers. (S.L.)

Charles, Prince of Wales. 1989. *A Vision of Britain: A Personal View of Architecture*. New York: Doubleday.

In this book, Charles, the Prince of Wales, advocates for architecture and urban design that are harmonious with local building traditions and maintain the local character. He justifies this preference by explaining that when people identify with a place, it creates a better quality of life and thus increases a project's chance of economic success by pleasing people more easily. Throughout the book, Prince Charles defines 10 principles, each guiding a different aspect of urban design:

1. The Place: "Don't rape the landscape."
2. Hierarchy: "If a building can't express itself, how can we understand it?"
3. Scale: "Less might be more; too much is not enough."
4. Harmony: "Sing with the choir and not against it."
5. Enclosure: "Give us somewhere safe for the children to play and let the wind play somewhere else."
6. Materials: "Let where it is be what it's made of."
7. Decoration: "A bare outline won't do; give us the details."
8. Art: "Michelangelo accepted very few commissions for a free-standing abstract sculpture in the forecourt."
9. Signs & Lights: "Don't make rude signs in public places."
10. Community: "Let the people who will have to live with what you build help guide your hand." (A.P.A.G.)

Cohen, Stuart. 1987. Contextualism: From urbanism to a theory of appropriate form. *Inland Architect* 31 (3): 68–69.

Cohen explains the beginning of contextualism in the 1960s. The author wrote this article after the publication of two articles by Lesnikowski in *Inland Architect* attacking contextualism theory. Cohen argues that contextualism is a theory to guide the proper insertion of buildings in existing cities, not a theory for the construction of new cities. He presents a very concise definition of the theory: "Contextualism proposes the establishment of physical continuities between adjacent buildings" (p. 69). According to Cohen, the degree of integration of a building into its context should depend on the building's civic importance and its hierarchy in the urban landscape. (A.P.A.G.)

[See the following entries for Lesnikowski's articles: Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextuality: Historic and modern perspectives. *Inland Architect* 30 (4):

51–60; Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextualism today. *Inland Architect* 30 (6): 49–59.]

Cramer, Johannes, and Stefan Breitling. 2007. *Architecture in Existing Fabric: Planning, Design, Building.* Basel: Birkhäuser.

This book focuses on rehabilitation and additions to historic buildings. Cramer and Breitling advocate that designing with existing buildings is a creative process as valid as designing new buildings, but more challenging. They present a methodology for designing with existing buildings that begins with a thorough survey and understanding of the structure and its values. Different intervention approaches are given: corrective maintenance, modernization, adaptation, and replacement. The authors identify four different relationship types between new and old architecture: correspondence, unification, fragmentation, and junction and delineation. The book also includes chapters on the specificities of a construction site around an existing structure and on sustainability in terms of adapting a structure to allow continuous use. (A.P.A.G.)

Davies, Michael. 2003. Design in the historic environment. *The Building Conservation Directory.* http://www.buildingconservation.com/articles/design/ design.htm

In this article, Davies questions whether preservation has become excessively strict regarding new construction in the historic environment. He defends that even though using compatible scale, proportion, and style provides a good basis for a successful new building in a historical context, the architect's design skills still have a great influence on the impact of the outcome on local character. According to the author, "design for the historic environment is polarized by two extremes: the very historic and the very modern. Then everything else fits somewhere in between on a sliding scale." Davies distinguishes five different design approaches illustrated with examples from the UK: pastiche, traditional, subtle, modern, and arrogant. (A.P.A.G.)

Dearing, Deborah. 1998. *Urban Form: An Urban Design Approach for Understanding the Urban Form of Regional Centres.* Sydney: Department of Urban Affairs and Planning.

This publication aims to increase understanding of the ways in which urban design can improve the quality of the urban environment. Produced by an Australian governmental department, it has been designed to inform and provide context for those who have a role in development, particularly local government planners, developers, residents, preservationists, and other interest groups. The publication focuses on the shape and configuration of the physical characteristics of a town or city rather than on details of an individual building's design and character. The study advocates analysis of the existing urban form and that new development should build on the distinct local character of the place. As part of the analysis, identification of appropriate developments should be addressed, as well as inappropriate or "unsuccessful" developments that detract from the character and context of the urban environment. The publica-

tion does not advocate mimicry of the existing urban environment; instead, it emphasizes an understanding of the evolution of the character of the place prior to proposing new development. Also included are several Australian urban and regional case studies where the urban form analysis was applied. (L.M.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, New South Wales, and Urban Design Advisory Service, New South Wales. 2000. *Residential Subdivisions: A Handbook for the Design and Planning of New Neighborhoods.* Sydney: Department of Urban Affairs and Planning.

This handbook provides guidance on the creation of new residential neighborhoods through a process that involves environment protection initiatives from the start of the project. Although this document focuses on urban design, its methodology is sympathetic to preexisting landscape features and historic structures. In part 3, "Good Neighborhood Design," the retention of historical features and landscape characteristics is justified based on the understanding that they add character to the future neighborhood, therefore contributing to a higher-quality design. (A.P.A.G.)

Edwards, A. Trystan. 1946. *Good and Bad Manners in Architecture.* London: J. Tiranti.

In this book, first published in 1924, Welsh architect and town planner Arthur Trystan Edwards (1884–1973) critiques architecture as it was practiced in his time. He adopts an anthropomorphic approach by defining building types as "selfish" buildings or the "unsociable" skyscraper. He also classifies a building's relationship to its neighbors as "polite" or "rude." Using this approach, Edwards defines how a new design should respond to its existing context. He also mentions the importance of human scale, presenting historical context for development of urbanism and providing examples of Greek, Roman, or Gothic cities and buildings. By highlighting and criticizing wrong cases, Edwards focuses mostly on how not to design in existing environments. (M.D.)

English Heritage, Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (CABE), and Kent Architecture Centre. 2007. *Building in Context Toolkit: New Development in Historic Areas.* London: English Heritage; CABE. http://www.building-in-context.org/the-bic-toolkit/

This website was developed as a training tool for local planning authorities in the UK who are responsible for approving new constructions in historic urban areas. The goal is to promote new development that is sensitive to its historic setting. The toolkit proposes a set of eight principles to guide appropriate design solutions. These principles can be used by authorities as criteria for the evaluation of proposals and also by architects to guide their design approach. One of the main recommendations is to undertake a value assessment prior to the start of the design process. The principles advocate for projects that are connected to the surrounding urban fabric and respect important views, the local scale, and building material quality. No recommendation is made regarding style, but

principle 8 promotes an architecture that "adds to the variety and texture of the setting." The website also provides a checklist to be used when appraising new design proposals, describes the level of design detail that is necessary for reviewers to properly understand the design proposal, and offers links to a series of case studies in the UK. (A.P.A.G.)

Fleming, Ronald Lee, Rachel Goldsmith, and J. A. Chewning. 1994. *Saving Face: How Corporate Franchise Design Can Respect Community Identity.* Planning Advisory Service Report, no. 452. Chicago: American Planning Association, Planning Advisory Service.

This book, an initiative of the US planning community, advocates for the appropriate local adaptation of standardized franchise design in order to maintain community character. The authors propose that this principle is relevant not only for historic areas but also for other types of communities. The book advocates for the implementation of a design review process or some other form of design control to ensure that franchise design is adapted to the local character. The authors promote the idea that using the same architectural language of the surrounding context is a better solution than using contrasting or neutral designs. Chapter 3 compares good and bad examples of local adaptations of franchise design. Chapter 4 presents five examples of communities that successfully implemented a design review process. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique, and Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Galerie nationales du Grand Palais (France). 1980. *Construire en quartier ancien: [exposition, Grand Palais, 5 mars au 21 avril 1980].* Paris: Ministère de l'environnement et du cadre de vie.

In French. This book is the result of the exhibition *Construire en Quartier Ancien* (Building in Ancient Neighborhoods), which took place at the Grand Palais from March 5 to April 21, 1980. Part I presents examples from the previous 20 years, emphasizing the relationships established between new buildings and the historic environment, not the particular style of the new building. Each chapter represents a different type of relationship. Chapter 1, "Le degree zero de l'insertion," contains designs that are indifferent to the context. Chapter 2, "L'intégration," has examples that show a will to create a building that is as homogeneous as possible with the context. Chapter 3, "Le contraste," presents examples that create a controlled, intentional break with the context. Chapter 4, "Le dérisoire et le précaire," includes designs that use an unexpected and almost caricature-like approach to reinterpret the context. Chapter 5, "L'invisibilité," presents projects that have adopted different artifices to blend into the context, such as transparency, trompe-l'oeil, camouflage, mirror, or underground. Chapter 6, "L'analogie," shows designs that seek a balance between identification with and differentiation from the context. Chapter 7, "Exemples complexes," presents designs that are complex in their attitude toward the context. These design solutions could fall in multiple categories of relationship to the context. Part II of the book contains case studies. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Goldberger, Paul. 2009. *Why Architecture Matters*. New Haven, CT: Yale
   University Press.

Architecture critic Paul Goldberger notes in his introduction that the purpose of
his book is to explain what buildings do beyond protecting people from the ele-
ments, when architecture "begins to say something about the world—when it
begins to take on the qualities of art" (p. ix). The seven chapters that follow
explore how people experience and see architecture, how it affects their intel-
lectual and emotional lives; how it can represent social, political, or cultural
ideas; and what role it plays in our memories. Chapter 7, "Buildings and Time,"
looks at the ways in which buildings change: we perceive buildings differently
as we ourselves change, buildings change through physical alteration, or their
context changes when new constructions occur in their vicinity and when cul-
tures change. (S.L.)

Gregotti, Vittorio. 1968. *New Directions in Italian Architecture*. Translated by
   Giuseppina Salvadori. New Directions in Architecture. London: Studio Vista.

Part of a series on significant approaches taken by architects in different coun-
tries, Gregotti's book analyzes the development of Italian architecture between
1918 and 1968. In it, he highlights the key figures, exhibitions, buildings, and
political events that illustrate the Italian response to modernism. The first chap-
ter explains how modernism had been conceived and developed in Italy in the
post–World War I period between 1919 and 1943, focusing on the rationalist and
"900" movements and their response to Fascism. In the second chapter, which
covers the post–World War II reconstruction period between 1944 and 1950, he
focuses on two cities: Rome as the administrative city and Milan as the indus-
trial city. Later chapters present the period between 1951 and 1958, when archi-
tects sought ways to design in the context of existing environment and
geomorphology, sometimes referencing historic architectural styles. Gregotti
marks 1959 as a turning point, when architects searched for a different way of
architecture, questioning the link not only with history but also as a manifesta-
tion of their socialist political views. Throughout the book, numerous examples
of new constructions in historic towns and cities are presented, such as BBPR's
Torre Velasca, in Milan, and Ignazio Gardella's House of the Zattere, in Venice.
(M.D., S.L.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Groat, Linda. 1983. Measuring the fit of new to old: A checklist resulting from a
   study of contextualism. *Architecture: The AIA Journal* 72 (11): 58–61.

In this article, Groat presents a framework that is intended to help the architect
identify which factors will determine the building's relationship to its context.
Eleven factors are presented and organized according to the degree of control
that the architect has over them. The author identifies both interior and exterior
building characteristics as influencing factors to be considered. Under "Given,"
Groat classifies factors that are usually determined by agents other than the
architect, such as site location, building type, and size. "Design Parameters"
classifies the factors that depend on external characteristics as well as on the

interpretation of the architect, such as prominence and definition of the context. "Design Strategy" classifies factors under full control of the architect, such as exterior site organization, interior spatial organization, exterior volumetric composition, interior semi-fixed arrangements, exterior surface composition, and interior surface treatment. (A.P.A.G.)

Harvard University, Graduate School of Design. 2005/2006. "Regeneration: Design as Dialogue, Building as Transformation." Special issue, *Harvard Design Magazine* (23).

This special issue addresses, but is not limited to, issues relating to contemporary architecture historic environments and the reuse or construction of additions to historic buildings. It comprises 14 essays on buildings and landscapes and several book reviews. The editor indicates that a large proportion of the architectural work in the United States is in adaptive reuse or additions to existing buildings, and that these designs are often overlooked in design magazines in favor of new architecture. He outlines that the reuse of buildings is economically sound and part of sustainable practices, and can have revitalized design qualities: "when new architecture is added to old, the results can have a richness, complexity and depth hard to achieve in completely new structures" (p. 3). He considers two approaches to the design of contemporary architecture in historic environments: first, a dialogic approach, and second, a reconstruction or imitation approach. The dialogic approach "integrate[s] history and varying values into the present…giving the present more definition through comparison and contrast," while the alternative approach is to reconstruct or imitate the old and is considered to be based on "conveying a longing for the familiar"; however, he notes reconstruction or imitation architecture is "no longer viable or honest modes of building and ways of being, trying to live in the past rather than appreciating it as past or using it to deepen our understanding of the present" (p. 3).

The collection of articles discusses (from a design and architecture perspective) design approaches, historical perceptions of design, the architectural profession's perception of the (increasing) value of designing additions to old buildings or insertions into historic environments and specific case studies that illustrate these views. A selection of useful articles and essays from the magazine include the following:

- In "Innovation and Insight in the Contemporary Architecture of Additions" (pp. 4–11), Paul Spencer Byard presents different approaches to designing additions, new insertions, and landscapes in historic environments. He views additions as a vehicle for understanding the past and the present; "holding up things against each other so each can be understood" (p. 9). The author assesses the dialogue between old and new using several examples of significant projects.
- In "Deference, Dialogue, and Dissolve: How New Architecture Meets Old" (pp. 12–17), Paul Buchanan describes three approaches to designing insertions or additions in historic environments: replicating the existing, contrasting with it, or collaging fragments that both replicate and contrast with the existing building or environment. He believes that the architect's agenda when designing an insertion or addition is to respect the web of relationships and values of the existing buildings and

context and to preserve and revitalize them. The author reviews projects and identifies that the contrast of old and new is preferred and adopted over the imitation approach. He provides a number of European examples to illustrate this concept. The author also sees the contrast approach as parasitical—each old and new part needing each other to give the building definition and legibility.

- In "Celebration of Complementary Architecture" (pp. 18–23), Wilfred Wang discusses how additions and new insertions are perceived in the architectural discourse. The author discusses "complementary architectures" where new and old elements are visually agreeable and in dialogue, versus "sole object architectures" that he considers to be dominant in media representations of architecture, myopic and isolated. He uses several European examples of 20th-century modern architects to illustrate the differences in these design approaches.

- In "Masked Nostalgia, Chic Regression: The 'Critical' Reconstruction of Berlin" (pp. 24–30), Sebastian Schmaling discusses the approaches to "rebuilding" in Berlin after World War II. He analyzes Berlin in terms of dialectic redesign, particularly focusing on political and social context of the adopted design approach.

- In "Reconstruction Doubts: The Ironies of Building in Schinkel's Name" (pp. 31–35), Barry Bergdoll discusses the reconstruction of historic buildings and the motivations of this design approach in Berlin. The article particularly refers to the demolition of the Palast der Republik and the precise reconstruction (or "re-creation") of the Berliner Schloss at the Schlossplatz, Berlin. The author is critical of the "replica" approach and expresses concerns about how the re-created city will be perceived in the future.

- "Gathering the Given: Michelangelo's Redesign of the Campidoglio" (pp. 42–47) is an article on redesign and insertion of new elements into a(n) (ancient) historic environment in the past. James Ackerman outlines the changes made by Michelangelo during the 30-year renovation of Capitoline Hill in Rome during the 16th century. (L.M.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Historic Scotland, Architecture + Design Scotland, and the Scottish Government. 2011. *New Design in Historic Settings*. Edinburgh: Historic Scotland. http://www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/new-design-in-historic-settings.pdf

This publication provides both principles and a methodology for designing new buildings and interventions in historic environments, which, if followed, will increase the chances of a successful and lasting result. The publication advocates that good design in historic areas must be based on a sound understanding of the area and its components. With few exceptions, the publication does not recommend replication of existing buildings; rather, it suggests that contemporary buildings can be successfully introduced in historic settings without compromising design quality or historic values, and become valued heritage to future generations. Chapter 3 presents eight principles to which new developments should respond: urban structure, urban grain, density and mix, scale, materials and detailing, landscape, views and landmarks, and historical devel-

opment. Chapter 4 presents a methodology to ensure that the design principles are met, which is composed of the following steps: analysis, evaluation, translation, and communication. Chapter 5 provides seven successful case studies of new projects in different types of historic settings across Scotland. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.2: Select Design Guideline Examples and Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Homes and Communities Agency. 2000. *Urban Design Compendium 1: Urban Design Principles*. London: Llewelyn-Davies. http://www.homesandcommunities.co.uk/urban-design-compendium?page_id=5542&%3B%3Bpage=179

———. 2013. *Urban Design Compendium 2: Delivering Quality Places*. London: Llewelyn-Davies. http://www.homesandcommunities.co.uk/urban-design-compendium?page_id=5610&%3B%3Bpage=180

These books offer guidance on the design process for development and redevelopment of urban areas. The design methodology presented is based on context analysis. Table 1.1 (p. 12, Compendium 1) summarizes the key aspects of urban design, one of which is to "enrich the existing," explained as "new development should enrich the qualities of existing urban places. This means encouraging a distinct response that arises from and complements its setting." Chapters 2 and 5 of Compendium 1 are the most relevant regarding new construction in historic neighborhoods. In chapter 2, "Appreciating the Context," "context" is defined as "the character and setting of the area" (p. 19). This explains the importance of identifying local assets and values through an analysis of local history and landscape patterns. The result of this analysis should guide the design process, because strengthening local character is identified as an important characteristic of a high-quality design. Chapter 5, "Detailing the Place," addresses building design more directly. In the section "Richness and Beauty" (p. 91), responding to neighboring buildings by creating continuity and strengthening local identity are identified as goals of the external composition of the new building. (A.P.A.G., L.M.)

Hurtt, Steven W. 1987. Contextualism of paradigms, politics and poetry: A rebuttal to Wojciech Lesnikowski's series on contextualism. *Inland Architect 31* (5): 66–75.

Hurtt wrote this article in order to defend contextualism against the criticism of Lesnikowski's articles. The author starts by analyzing Lesnikowski's motives and inspirations in order to understand his arguments in their context. Hurtt accuses Lesnikowski of being modernist and of making use of arguments that appeal to the public's culture and psyche in defending his stand against contextualism. (A.P.A.G.)

[See the following entries for Lesnikowski's articles: Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextuality: Historic and modern perspectives, Part I. *Inland Architect* 30 (4): 51–60; Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextualism today. *Inland Architect* 30 (6): 49–59.]

International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1975. Contemporary Architecture in Ancient Groups of Buildings. Budapest Symposium, June 28–30, 1972 = L'integrationde l'architecture contemporaine dans les ensembles historiques. Colloque de Budapest, 28–30 juin 1972. Special issue, *Monumentum* (11–12). http://www.international.icomos.org/monumentum/ vol11-12/index.html

This special issue of *Monumentum* contains papers presented at the Symposium on the Introduction of Contemporary Architecture into Ancient Groups of Buildings, which took place at the 3rd General Assembly of ICOMOS in Budapest (June 28–30, 1972). In the introduction, Piero Gazzola positions ICOMOS as neutral in the progress-preservation dichotomy. He places the organization of the symposium in the context of a shift in the methodology of cultural heritage conservation, which consisted of changing focus from material preservation of heritage assets to the reinsertion of heritage in the daily life of contemporary society. The first article, by Miklos Horler, offers a general account of the symposium and the historical context of the discussion. Horler recognizes that this subject has polarized conservation practitioners throughout history. He observes that most symposium participants agree that modern urban life should be reinserted in historic centers. Additionally, the majority agree that the appropriate type of architecture for an infill project in a historic urban context depends on the specifics of the site, although most gave a preference for either a neutral or modern architectural expression. Horler identifies the Cáceres ICOMOS symposium (1967) as the point where ICOMOS first became involved in the discussion and summarizes the organization's position at the time: "The speakers also declared that in their opinion architecture must not be used unrestrictedly; 'new architecture' did not mean complete freedom from any constraint whatever, and architecture which showed indifference to its surroundings and was in violent contrast with them was not truly modern, since respect for the existing setting was one of the fundamental duties of the architects of our day" (pp.14–15). (A.P.A.G.)

[See also under Chapter 1: Conservation Policy: International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). 1972. *Resolutions of the Symposium on the Introduction of Contemporary Architecture into Ancient Groups of Buildings at the 3rd ICOMOS General Assembly (1972)*.]

Jencks, Charles. 2005. *The Iconic Building*. New York: Rizzoli.

In this book, the author, an American architecture theorist, analyzes the phenomenon of buildings that are designed to become icons. This design approach became popular after the construction of the Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao (1993–97), designed by Frank Gehry. According to Jencks, "[the iconic building] is meant to upset the context, overturn convention, challenge the hierarchy, get away with crime" (p. 16). The adoption of this approach is usually driven by the need to spark economic redevelopment and marketing.
Jencks's neutral position on the subject makes this book a good tool in attempting to understand current approaches to infill architecture in historical contexts and what the motivations behind it might be. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Knox, Paul. 2012. Starchitect, starchitecture, and the symbolic capital of the world cities. In *International Handbook of Globalization and World Cities*, eds. Ben Derudder, Michael Hoyler, Peter J. Taylor, and Frank Witlox, 275–83. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.

In this article, Paul Knox analyzes the social context that enabled the creation of "starchitects." He also analyzes the impact of "starchitecture" in urban regeneration and city identity. Knox identifies controversy as a necessary means of promotion in this type of architecture. (A.P.A.G.)

Larkham, Peter J. 1996. *Conservation and the City. London*: Routledge.

The book discusses the conflict between a city's need to change and the need to preserve its history. It focuses on understanding how changes occur and which agents cause or influence the outcome. In chapter 10, "The Impact of Change on the Conserved Townscape," Larkham explains the rise of context and conservation-based planning and architecture as a reaction to a design approach that ignored built heritage and aimed at its total replacement. This approach had been adopted in many European countries during the reconstruction following World War II. The author classifies the different approaches to context-based design as deliberate contrast, the use of local idiom, disguise, and the use of historicist architectural styles. (A.P.A.G.)

Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextuality: Historic and modern perspectives, Part I. *Inland Architect* 30 (4): 51–60.

This is the first of two articles by Lesnikowski written as a criticism of contextualist theory and published in *Inland Architect*. The author begins by tracing the historical use of context in western architecture from imperial Rome to the present day, with an emphasis on the Italian Renaissance. He concludes that contextual solutions usually resulted from an inability to change the context. Lesnikowski also argues that the use of noncontextual solutions was not exclusive to the Modernist Movement, as it often had been used as an artifice to create monumentality throughout history. In addition, he argues that the will to impose order on an existing chaotic context by laying an idealized plan over it has not been an exclusive trait of modernism. He explains that the seemingly harmonious solutions of past styles was a result of a shared guiding theory that persisted for a long period of time. (A.P.A.G.)

[See the entries above for responses to this article: Cohen, Stuart. 1987. Contextualism: From urbanism to a theory of appropriate form. *Inland Architect* 31 (3): 68–69; Hurtt, Steven W. 1987. Contextualism of paradigms, politics and poetry: A rebuttal to Wojciech Lesnikowski's series on contextualism. *Inland Architect* 31 (5): 66–75.]

Lesnikowski, Wojciech. 1986. Contextualism today, Part 2. *Inland Architect* 30 (6): 49–59.

This is the second of Lesnikowski's articles criticizing contextualism, published in *Inland Architect*. The author analyzes the theory developed by architects and

theorists Leon and Rob Krier. Although Lesnikowski admits that modern urban design did not produce successful results, he criticizes contextualism for perpetuating a fragmented city. He recognizes the potential of contextualism but warns of its pitfalls. He condemns the fact that his contextualist contemporaries "end up representing an historically influenced mixed bag of formal tricks rather than a thoughtful adaptation of history" (p. 59). (A.P.A.G.)

[See the entries above for responses to this article: Cohen, Stuart. 1987. Contextualism: From urbanism to a theory of appropriate form. *Inland Architect* 31 (3): 68–69; Hurtt, Steven W. 1987. Contextualism of paradigms, politics and poetry: A rebuttal to Wojciech Lesnikowski's series on contextualism. *Inland Architect* 31 (5): 66–75.]

Macdonald, Susan. 2011. Contemporary architecture in historic urban environments. *Conservation Perspectives: The GCI Newsletter* 26 (2): 13–15. http://www.getty.edu/conservation/publications_resources/newsletters/26_2/contemporary.html

This article discusses, from a heritage conservation point of view, approaches to accommodating change in heritage places and adding new insertions into historic environments. It discusses the pressures encountered by governments, conservationists, and decision makers about what constitutes appropriate changes to historic buildings and in historic environments. The author asserts that change is inevitable, and it is important to determine the role of contemporary architecture in the historic environment that reinvigorates these areas while conserving the place's heritage values. Macdonald reviews the phenomenon of "starchitecture" in historic environments and its impact on the significance of cultural heritage places. She proposes a more balanced design and design review process for architectural insertions moving forward. (L.M.)

National Trust for Historic Preservation, Society of Architectural Historians, Latrobe Chapter, and American Institute of Architects, Washington Metropolitan Chapter. 1980. *Old and New Architecture: Design Relationship: From a Conference.* Washington, D.C.: Preservation Press, National Trust for Historic Preservation.

This book is a compilation of papers presented at the conference "Old and New Architecture: Design Relationship," organized by the National Trust for Historic Preservation in 1977. These papers were based on the recognition that change is inevitable, and therefore preservation depends on managing change. The first part of the book analyzes the relationship of old and new architecture throughout history. The second part is a photo essay that classifies examples of relationships between old and new architecture from the US and Europe into invisible addition, anonymous addition, and polite deception. The third part contains papers describing different design approaches. The fourth, and final, part discusses the use of design guidelines and reviews to control change in the historic environment. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique.

Petruccioli, Attilio, ed. 1995. *Typological Process and Design Theory*. Cambridge, MA.: Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture at Harvard University; Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

This publication includes the proceedings of a symposium held at Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) in 1995. The purpose of this symposium was to discuss design methodologies that could be used in existing urban environments in the East and West. Several papers of relevance to the bibliography include the following:

- Giancarlo Cataldi's paper, "Design Strategies in the Typological Concept of the Italian School of Soverio Muratori," presents typological research focusing on the stages of design development. Cataldi summarizes Muratori's ideas and presents three projects showing how design inputs can be generated through analysis of the existing fabric.
- Attilio Petruccioli's paper, "Alice's Dilemma," consists of two parts. The first part focuses on the principles of Muratori. The second part is the possible implementations of Muratori's ideas. Petruccioli highlights Muratori's teaching in the School of Architecture in Venice, where he advocated that without knowing the history and without being aware of the self, one cannot design.
- Giuseppe Strappa's paper, "The Nation of Enclosure in the Formation of Special Building Type," is a research on typology. He focuses on creating typologies and appreciation of the space, using typologies to differentiate cultural areas, and using same principles to set design criteria. (M.D.)

Piano, Renzo, and Lodovico Folin Calabe. 2010. Interview with Renzo Piano. *World Heritage Review* (55): 56–58.

In this interview, Italian architect Renzo Piano expresses his views on how to design interventions in the historic city. When talking about his addition to the Morgan Library in New York, Piano says "the relationship with what already exists calls for a dialogue.… it is rather like conversing with a person who inspires you to self-discipline but not to self-censorship" (p. 58). (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Portoghesi, Paolo, Vincent Scully, Charles Jencks, and Christian Norberg-Schulz. 1980. *The Presence of the Past: First International Exhibition of Architecture: The Corderia of the Arsenale: La Biennale di Venezia 1980: Architectural Section*. London: Academy Editions.

This book is a catalog of essays from the inaugural architecture exhibition at the Venice Biennale in 1980. It was the first time architecture had been separated as an autonomous exhibition from the fine arts. The title of the exhibition, "Presence of the Past," presents a range of ideas relating to modernism and postmodernism. Five essays introduce a range of views on architecture that align with or reject modernism in different ways and to varying degrees. Although the book is not directly about new insertions in historic environments, some of the authors discuss postmodernist views about the impact of modern buildings and urban planning on historic cities and districts. Common themes

in the book include the search for meaning and historicity in current (i.e., 1980) architectural forms and a reassessment of the virtues of traditional architectural forms that had been rejected by the Modern Movement. (L.M.)

Ray, Keith, ed. 1980. *Contextual Architecture: Responding to Existing Style*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

In this book, the author uses examples to demonstrate different ways in which design can create a relationship between a new building and the extant built fabric surrounding it. The author divides the examples among four chapters according to the scale of the intervention. Each chapter shows a range of design solutions, from reproduction to sympathetic contrast. Chapter 4, "Infill," describes five approaches to designing new constructions in existing urban contexts:
- "Reproduction" (preferably in a style not of an existing building) can be appropriate if the context is homogeneous in terms of architectural style.
- "Abstraction" is defined as a contemporary interpretation of the most characteristic local features.
- "Buildings based on urban design" follow the characteristics of the urban setting instead of building features.
- "Background buildings" are new constructions where the design tries to minimize adverse impact on the local context by partially concealing the new building or by blending with the context.
- "Sympathetic contrast" is a contrasting design that adds quality to the urban context by unifying it or by creating a focal point where there was previously none. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Richards, Kristen. 2003. History as prelude: Modern interventions in historic context. *Oculus* 65 (1): 24–27.

This article is an account of an event organized by the American Institute of Architects (AIA), New York Chapter, the Center for Architecture, and the James Marston Fitch Colloquium to discuss the appropriateness of modern additions to historic landmarks and neighborhoods. Examples from New York were presented by their designers to illustrate how contemporary architecture can coexist with historic buildings without compromising their integrity. In these examples, the design solution resulted from a willingness to create a relationship with the historic building. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Rogers, Richard. 1988. Belief in the future is rooted in the memory of the past. *RSA Journal* 136 (5388 Nov.): 873–84.

This is a transcript of a talk delivered by British architect Richard Rogers at the Royal Society of Arts on April 18, 1988. Among many subjects, Rogers advocates for the advancement of modern architecture through further development

of its ideas and a willingness to adapt itself to changing needs and to learn from past mistakes. Rogers criticizes the use of architectural elements from previous periods by postmodernist architects. His criticism also targets Prince Charles's interventions in the architecture field. Rogers advocates for the creation of harmonious cityscapes by juxtaposition of buildings of different styles, each reflecting the time of its conception, similar to the formation of historic cityscapes such as Venice. Answering a question from Patrick Garnett about design proposals for the National Gallery in London, Rogers defends his position by saying "scale is more important than style [in the formation of a harmonious urban environment]" (p. 883). In the same answer, he also states that "to copy the neighboring buildings belittles the past." (A.P.A.G.)

Schumacher, Tom. 1971. Contextualism: Urban ideals and deformation. *Casabella* 35 (359–60): 78–86.

In this article, the author addresses the architecture and urbanism community, presenting contextualism as the most appropriate theory to deal with the problems faced by 20th-century cities. Schumacher defines contextualism as the middle ground between traditional and modern urbanism. According to the author, the final form of a building should be a result of both internal and external forces. He considers a building's functional requirement as the internal force that should be formed by external pressures coming from the context in which the building will be inserted. Schumacher argues that the designer is able to strike a balance by equally considering both influences. (A.P.A.G.)

Semes, Steven W. 2009. *The Future of the Past: A Conservation Ethic for Architecture, Urbanism, and Historic Preservation*. New York: Norton.

Semes's approach to designing new constructions in historic urban environments is rooted in the idea that these sites should be treated as "living entities." Consequently, these sites should be allowed to adapt to current needs as long as the proposed solutions do not compromise the characteristics that define the site's historic values. In order to facilitate understanding among the different professionals involved in the preservation of historic cities, Semes proposes that architects, planners, and preservationists agree upon the same conservation ethic. Throughout the book, the author identifies four different approaches to designing in the historic city: literal replication (chapter 8), invention within a style (chapter 9), abstract reference (chapter 10), and intentional opposition (chapter 11). However, chapter 1 leaves no doubt that the book advocates for "continuity instead of contrast—without copying historic buildings and without introducing alien forms" (p. 29). Semes bases his design approach on the methodology of traditional architecture. He defines this design methodology as designing by respecting the lessons of past architecture practices and by building on its successful models and examples. According to the author, this approach results in gradual change to the built environment as opposed to the abrupt changes caused by contemporary designs that are divorced from their context. It is important to note that the author prescribes not a style but a methodology. (A.P.A.G.)

Smeallie, Peter H., and Peter H. K. Smith. 1990. *New Construction for Older Buildings: A Design Sourcebook for Architects and Preservationists*. New York: Wiley.

This book focuses on solutions to common challenges in designing with old buildings. The ideas presented are illustrated with successful examples of designs built in historic environments during the 1980s in the United States. The book is divided in three sections: "Additions to Buildings," "Altering the Original," and "Constructing Anew Amid Old." In the last section, the authors advocate for designs that reinterpret those architectural elements that contribute to local identity. They define "contextualism" as the effort to understand how the new fits with the old during the design process. The chapters in this section are organized according to the positioning of the new building in the historic fabric: freestanding, attached, facadism, infill, and urban design interventions. (A.P.A.G.)

Strike, James. 1994. *Architecture in Conservation: Managing Development at Historic Sites*. London: Routledge.

The aim of this book is to present the issues involved in designing new buildings in historic settings independently of allegiance to a particular architectural style. It focuses on analyzing the different types of connections that can be created between old and new architecture. Strike advocates that the identification of the issues involved in designing new buildings in historic settings can guide decisions during the design process and also serve as criteria to evaluate the appropriateness of a proposal. This book looks at different aspects of new design in historic settings, including design control, which is presented in chapter 2. Chapter 3, "Connections by Association," analyzes how buildings are perceived and how they can convey connections with other buildings. Chapter 4, "Response to Location," explores how the historical context can influence design. Chapter 5, "At the Monument," focuses on new additions to historic buildings. Chapter 6, "Connections by Assimilation," analyzes how the reinterpretation of historic architectural elements can create connections between old and new. Chapter 7, "Presence or Anonymity," discusses different approaches to designing in historic environments. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique.

Tiesdell, Steven, Taner Oc, and Tim Heath. 1996. *Revitalizing Historic Urban Quarters*. Oxford: Architectural Press.

This book analyzes different aspects of revitalization projects and the challenges of minimizing physical impacts of economic and functional change on a historic environment. Chapter 7, "Design in Historic Urban Quarters," analyzes different approaches to intervention, such as rehabilitation of individual buildings, facadism, and new development. The authors classify approaches to new developments as contextual uniformity, contextual juxtaposition, and contextual continuity. The ideas presented are illustrated with examples from England. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Tyler, Norman, Ted Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler. 2009. *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*. 2nd ed. New York: Norton.

This book introduces the basic concepts of historic preservation, from public policy to preservation technology in the context of the United States. Chapter 1 includes the definition of different categories of intervention as stated in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (United States). Chapter 7, "Design Issues," concerns the design of new buildings or additions to historic sites. In this chapter, Tyler argues that architects of the postmodern era are more sensitive to the value of history and thereby recognize the need to design buildings that are compatible with their contexts. [This book was first published in 1994, before the phenomenon of "starchitecture" had been well established; Frank Gehry's Guggenheim Museum Bilbao opened in 1997. See entry above: Jencks, Charles. 2005. *The Iconic Building*. New York: Rizzoli.] Tyler identifies three design approaches for historic environments: matching, contrasting, and compatible. These approaches are illustrated with examples from the United States. The author advocates for the adoption of clear design guidelines and review committees to facilitate dialogue with property owners. This idea is supported by examples of American cities that have successfully adopted these design regulation tools. Also discussed is how preservation sees facadism and warns of the dangers of adopting this type of intervention method. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique.

Warren, John, John Worthington, and Sue Taylor, eds. 1998. *Context: New Buildings in Historic Settings*. Oxford: Architectural Press.

This book resulted from a conference on new buildings in historic settings, held in October 1996 at the University of York's Institute of Advanced Architectural Studies. Sections 1 and 2 detail points of view from philosophers and policy makers. Section 3 presents the architects' point of view. The common ground for all authors is the recognition that change is necessary and should be allowed, provided that it creates continuity with the past. (A.P.A.G.)

Williamson, Kenneth. 2010. *Development and Design of Heritage Sensitive Sites: Strategies for Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas*. London: Routledge.

In this book, Williamson presents a methodology for the development of projects in historic areas that starts by building a sound understanding of how the area has evolved and identifying the relevant legal constraints. The author writes from his experience in Scotland. Part 1 offers information on the government agencies in Scotland that are responsible for reviewing projects that might affect heritage sites and the key principles that guide their decision-making process. Part 2 concerns the significance assessment that should serve as the basis for an analysis of the project's expected impact on historical resources. Part 3 describes the review process and how to present a case for approval by regulatory agencies. Part 4 presents three case studies in Scotland. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 4: Case Studies.

Worskett, Roy. 1982. Design in Conservation. New buildings in historic areas, I: Conservation: The missing ethic. *Monumentum* 25 (2): 129–54. http://www. international.icomos.org/monumentum/vol25-2/vol25-2_3.pdf

In this article, Worskett accuses preservation of being overly protective of historic cities, thereby arresting the process of progressive change that he considers to be an essential characteristic of these sites. The author associates this problem with a reaction against modernist redevelopment initiatives. He identifies the need for a new preservation ethic to guide appropriate interventions in the historic environment that allows an acceptable amount of change to occur. Worskett advocates that the goal should be to avoid both fake reconstructions (which he compares to the creation of a Disneyland-type environment) and modern architecture that ignores the context and harms its character. (A.P.A.G.)

Zancheti, Silvio Mendes, Aline de Figueirôa Silva, Anna Caroline Braga, Fabiana Gonçalves Gameiro, Flaviana Barreto Lira, and Luciana Santiago Costa. 2006. The patina of the city. *City & Time* 2 (2): 11–22. http://www.ceci-br.org/novo/ revista/docs2006/CT-2006-48.pdf

This paper discusses patina, defined as "the effect left by the passage of time on the exterior surfaces of urban elements and on social practices" in cities (p. 11). It provides a critical literature review on a number of concepts of patina in context of urban environments—from physical decay of materials and buildings to immaterial social dimensions. The authors identify that patina can be a defining character of a city and assert that new architectural insertions or "urban regeneration" can have an adverse effect on the patina of the city, producing "abrupt changes in these places, and wipe out the patina" (p. 21). Alternatively, urban regeneration can have a positive and transformative effect on the patina of the city. The authors emphasize that "patina must be considered so that places do not lose their identity, authenticity and historicity" (p. 21).
These ideas are illustrated by examples from various cities throughout Brazil. The paper explains that "when interventions are made in old areas, the patina of which has become an inherent part of their identity, the attempt should be made to grade the transformations in time, inevitably for contemporary uses, in such a way that the patina may regenerate itself on the old surfaces and re-emerge on the surface of new elements" (p. 11). (L.M.)

Zyscovich, Bernard, and Douglas R. Porter. 2008. *Getting Real about Urbanism: Contextual Design for Cities*. Washington, DC: Urban Land Institute.

In this book, the authors discuss the concept of contextual urbanism. They advocate that the best form of urban design is one that responds to the "historical and contextual ambience of specific sites" (p. 8). The book promotes redevelopment in infill areas. Chapter 2 proposes guiding principles for contextual urban design. One of these principles identifies the need for "distinctive communities with a strong sense of place" (p. 21), thus making identification and preservation of local character an important part of contextual urban design. Chapter 4 proposes a methodology for the preparatory research phase that should precede the proposal of a design solution. The concept proposed by the authors is illustrated with examples from the United States. (A.P.A.G.)

CHAPTER 4

Case Studies

Bayerische Architektenkammer and Die Neue Sammlung, Munich. 1978. *New Building in Old Settings: An Exhibition Organized by the Bayerische Architektenkammer and Die Neue Sammlung, Munich*. Munich: Die Neue Sammlung, State Museum for Applied Arts.

This exhibition catalog shows European examples of new constructions inserted in old urban contexts. Most examples consist of buildings from the 1960s and 1970s, with few historic structures. The examples are briefly described and illustrated with black-and-white photographs and architectural drawings. The goals of the exhibition were to show that the problem of fitting new buildings in old settings is not a recent phenomenon, to demonstrate the different design approaches capable of creating a high-quality relationship between the new and the old buildings, and to show the general public the challenges an architect faces when designing a new building in an old setting. The first part of the catalog contains three essays concerning different aspects of the subject. In "New Building in Old Settings," Friedrich Kurrent introduces the goals of the exhibition. Kurrent gives examples of ancient buildings that were built in preexisting urban settings. He raises the point that some of these buildings, originally perceived as intrusive or offensive to the historic setting, later became an integral part of it. He advocates a design approach that strives to achieve a balance between adaptation and contrast. Kurrent does not endorse subordination of the new to the old; instead, he promotes a relationship based on learning from the old in order to achieve integration with the context. In "Building in Old Settings as a Problem of Place," Christian Norberg-Schulz writes on the importance of place identity and the contribution of each individual building in creating that identity. In "Integration of Old and New," Manfred Sack warns of the dangers of overprotecting the historic city. He advocates that the process of change in the urban fabric should be regulated but not stopped. He presents three different approaches to designing in historic environments: plot, contrast, and quotation. *Plot* refers to following the proportions, site layout, and materials. *Contrast* refers to consciously using contrasting design to change the urban setting. *Quotation* refers to a design approach that draws inspiration from the past to create a contemporary design. (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Chapter 3: Design Approaches and Philosophies.

Economakis, Richard, ed. 1993. "Interventions in Historic Centres: The Buildings of Magdalen College, Oxford." Special issue, *Architectural Design*.

This publication presents excerpts from the international forum "Interventions in Historic Centres," held at Magdalen College, Oxford, on October 17, 1992.

The forum was organized to coincide with the presentation of architect Demetri Porphyrios's proposal for the new Longwall Quadrangle at Oxford University, and it brought together many leading classicist practitioners and historians, such as Porphyrios, Rob Krier, Terry Farrell, John Simpson, Maurice Culot, David Watking, and Oswyn Murray, to speak on classical interventions in historic centers. The publication includes essays by the various participants, extracts from the forum's discussions, and profiles of projects at Magdalen College and at Rue de Laeken, in Brussels, as well as proposals for the reconstruction of war-damaged areas of Amiens, an international conference and finance center in Edinburgh, and the reconstruction of the area around St. Paul's Cathedral, in London. (S.L.)

English Heritage. 2008. *Constructive Conservation in Practice*. HELM Guides. London: English Heritage. https://content.historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/constructive-conservation-in-practice/ccdpsweb.pdf/

The goal of this publication is to offer successful examples of redevelopment projects in historic sites. This publication is written for those local authorities responsible for evaluating design proposals, as well as for the developers and architects authoring those proposals. The book includes 20 examples illustrating rehabilitation, additions, and new building projects. These examples employ the concept of constructive conservation, which aims to create the necessary conditions for the continuous use of a historic site with interventions that enhance its values. In order to achieve this goal, the design methodology must be based on the identification of the site's heritage values. This approach allows change in areas of less significance in order to support the conservation of the most significant parts. (A.P.A.G.)

English Heritage. 2011. *Valuing Places: Good Practice in Conservation Areas*. HELM Guides. London: English Heritage. https://content.historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/valuing-places/valuing-places-good-practice-conservation-areas.pdf/

This publication argues that successful conservation can be achieved through careful management of change. It includes 18 projects in different phases of planning and implementation that illustrate different responses to context. The book advocates the constructive conservation approach described in English Heritage's *Constructive Conservation in Practice* [see entry above]. Examples located in Cambridge, Nottingham, and Sheffield are cases where new buildings were proposed in historic urban settings. (A.P.A.G.)

Forshaw, Alec. 2013. *New City: Contemporary Architecture in the City of London*. London: Merrell Publishers Limited.

This book comprises an overview of architectural developments in the City of London since 1986. The author considers the political, economic, and social motivations that have driven architectural change in the City since the 1980s, placing these changes in the context of the history of renewal and replacement of buildings in London over the past two thousand years. The introduction pres-

ents these concepts and is followed by a series of 12 walks, with maps and photographs, that describe historic and contemporary buildings and their settings and context. As part of the latter examples, the author touches on the appropriateness of the new (1980s–2010s) buildings in terms of the principles of heritage conservation and urban design. However, he predominately describes and assesses the new buildings on their own design merit as well as in term of their immediate context.

The introduction provides an introduction to the economic, political, and social influences to the architecture of the City. The author does not discuss heritage conservation as an issue in detail but considers a variety of design and contextual factors that influence the quality of insertions in historic environments.

The author views heritage conservation as having fluctuating fortunes in terms of new insertions in the historic environment. He describes the concept of "discrepancies of contrast" used to justify the construction of tall new structures adjacent to historic buildings. The book highlights that not every building needs to be iconic (and that the age of "starchitecture" may be over) as the City needs to be an urbane and humane place with quality background buildings. Examples of successful heritage conservation projects in London include adaptive reuse of historic buildings to economically viable and appropriate purposes and indicate that the character of the City has been conserved by retaining medieval street patterns. (L.M.)

Foster, Norman, and Chris Abel. 2011. *Carre d'Art, Nîmes: Foster + Partners*. Munich: Prestel.

This book is a study of Norman Foster's Carré d'Art, in Nîmes, France. The building was opened in 1993 after Foster won an international architecture competition to design a *médiathèque* in the center of Nîmes, which, at the time, was being used as a parking lot. The Carré d'Art includes a library, art gallery, and place for cinema, music, and video. The site is located in a historic district opposite the Maison Carrée, constructed in approximately 16 BCE and subsequently reconstructed in 5 CE, and considered by the authors to be one of the best-preserved Roman buildings in the former empire.

Development of the architectural design of the Carré d'Art by Foster is discussed, particularly in terms of urban design and human geography. Foster considers the development of the site in the context of the immediate surroundings, historical associations, and the broader city itself. Also discussed are the challenges of relating the old to the new, the architectural dialogue of the new building with the Maison Carrée, and the insertion of a new building so as to continuity to the historic area as a setting for contemporary urban life. (L.M.)

Jäger, Frank Peter, ed. 2010. *Old and New: Design Manual for Revitalizing Existing Buildings*. Basel: Birkhäuser.

This book presents 32 case studies on the modification of existing historic buildings in Europe, principally from German-speaking countries. The book discusses additions to, adaptation of, and reuse of existing buildings rather than stand-alone new architectural insertions in historic environments; however, the ideas discussed may also be applicable to new architectural insertions. The case

studies demonstrate the relationship between the old and new and the variety of outcomes this architectural dialogue can produce.

The editor points out that the value of working with existing buildings is that new construction adds diversity and "enhances the existing substance" of place and "endows it with new interpretation" (p. 9). Other reasons to reuse and adapt existing buildings include historic preservation values and issues of sustainability.

The case studies are categorized by type of construction: addition, transformation, and conversion. Project details such as costs, size, floor area, date of completion, and design and construction team are included. Photographs and architectural plans illustrate the overall case study as well as particular architectural solutions that may be of interest to the preservation architect and planner. (L.M.)

Kelly, Francis. 1990. The purpose of pastiche. *Architects' Journal* 192 (5): 24–27.

In this article, the author analyzes two projects for new commercial buildings in historic areas in the World Heritage City of Bath, England. Kelly's criticism is focused on the quality of the designs. The author admits that the language of classicism might be appropriate to a site, but only if properly executed. That is, if the architect applies classical architectural elements, this should be done with a sound knowledge of classical composition. Classical architecture should, then, govern all aspects of the design and not be restricted to the facade composition. The author criticizes the nonexistent relationship between the exteriors and interiors of the examples built in Bath, where contemporary commercial buildings were disguised behind classical residential exteriors. (A.P.A.G.)

Knox, Paul L. 2012. *Palimpsests: Biographies of 50 City Districts: International Case Studies of Urban Change*. Basel: Birkhäuser.

This book includes 50 case studies of urban design, new architectural insertions, and redesign of historic urban environments. The book primarily focuses on the city that is composed of districts, each with its own character that has changed over time. A city is a "palimpsest of social, economic and architectural history" (p. 6); that is, each district is a repository of changing ideals in architecture, urban design, planning, consumer taste, and real estate development.

The case studies focus on the urban character of a number of cities and districts in Europe, America, and the United Kingdom. Some of the case studies demonstrate changes in historic cities or districts over time and, although these include new architectural insertions in the urban fabric, do not always relate to this bibliography. Key examples in relation to the topic of the bibliography include regeneration of historic districts through gentrification. A number of examples of gentrification are in historic and former industrial areas such as Bilbao. Case studies discuss the issue of "starchitecture" in historic urban places and its impact on the local community. (M.D., L.M.)

Kucharek, Jan-Carlos. 2010. Sense and sensibility. *RIBA Journal* 44 (May): 44–48.

In this article, the author analyzes the design of the new Southgate Shopping Centre, in Bath, England. This commercial development replaced an unsuccessful Brutalist version that previously occupied the site, located at Bath's historic center. Kucharek discusses the architect's difficulty in integrating modern construction details in a traditionally designed facade. He argues that the classical style was better employed at the urban design scale. (A.P.A.G.)

Moneo, José Rafael. 2010. *Rafael Moneo: Remarks on 21 Works*. Edited by Laura Martínez de Guereñu. London: Thames & Hudson.

This monograph by Spanish architect Rafael Moneo (b. 1937) documents 21 of his projects. Photographs and drawings of each of the projects are accompanied by essays written by Moneo that "attempt to explain the guiding principles that have inspired [his] work, that clarify [his] approach to architecture" (p. 9). As many of the projects are located in historic settings, such as the Museum of Roman Art, in Mérida (1980–86) and the Prado Museum extension in Madrid (1998–2007), the essays provide insight into Moneo's consideration of context and his design approach when intervening in historic areas, as well as the theories and works of past architects that have influenced his own principles. For example, in his essay on the Previsión Española Insurance Company in Seville (1982–87), Moneo addresses the question of how to build in historic cities. He begins by revisiting earlier debates on the subject, particularly those in Italy in the mid-20th century, before describing his analysis of Seville's plan and interpretation of its character. Moneo then discusses his design, describing how it consolidates the city's overall structure, marks the earlier city walls on the site, and responds to the nearby Torre del Oro. Moneo concludes, "If the historic cities that make up our heritage deserve to be preserved, it is difficult for the architect to disregard an overall vision of the city" (p. 149). In his essay on the city hall extension in Murcia (1991–98), Moneo discusses his approach to filling a void at one side of the city's main plaza and how his building coexists with the others "without making stylistic references or concessions to the surroundings" (p. 447). (S.L.)

Moore, Arthur Cotton. 1998. *The Powers of Preservation: New Life for Urban Historic Places*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

This book is based on the author's professional experience working with rehabilitation projects in Washington, DC. He focuses on the political, social, and economic contexts of interventions in historic urban environments. The author presents his ideas through both successful and unsuccessful examples. Chapters 1, 2, 4, and 5 are structured around the presentation of these examples, grouped by type of intervention: adaptation, restoration, downtowns, and cities. The closing section of each chapter summarizes the lessons learned through the examples presented. In chapter 3, Moore presents his opinions on design methodology, which he organized along three different themes: incompatible additions to historic buildings; differences between making a fake and properly using a past style; and recommendations for a design process. Chapter 6 presents the author's conclusions. (A.P.A.G.)

Olsberg, Nicholas, George Ranalli, Jean-François Bédard, Sergio Polano, Alba Di
Lieto, and Mildred Friedman. 1999. *Carlo Scarpa, Architect: Intervening with
History*. Montreal: Canadian Centre for Architecture; New York: Monacelli
Press.

This book is based on an exhibition that was organized at the Canadian Centre
for Architecture on eight designs of Italian architect Carlo Scarpa. The designs
chosen for this exhibition constitute Scarpa's most important works built on his-
toric settings. The intent is to demonstrate the complex relationships Scarpa
created between old and new built fabric. Scarpa's intention was to create an
architectural language that could express its time but still maintain a relation-
ship with the past. In the introduction, Nicholas Olsberg explains that the eight
designs shown in the exhibition demonstrate Scarpa's "relentless concern with
context, in its broadest sense: time past, present, and future; the common sense
of a place and the careful reading of its visual character; the methodological
traditions of design; and artisanal techniques in building" (p. 10). The book
includes an essay by Alba Di Lieto, "The Renewal of Castelvecchio," which
analyzes in more detail Scarpa's best-known intervention in a historic building.
The essay "Scarpa Today," by Mildred Friedman, reviews Scarpa's influence on
current architects, particularly regarding how they negotiate the introduction of
contemporary designs in traditional settings. (A.P.A.G.)

Phillips, Brian, Deborah Grossberg Katz, Hilary Jay, and Elise Vider, curators.
2011. *Gray Area: Provocations on the Future of Preservation*. Philadelphia:
Pew Center for Arts and Heritage. http://elisevider.com/pdf/misc/grayarea.pdf

This catalog was published as a complement to a panel discussion organized by
DesignPhiladelphia in 2011 with the aim of stimulating dialogue on how inno-
vative design, in both adaptive reuse and new construction, can make positive
contributions to the preservation of historic sites. It compiles 30 case studies,
most of which are in Philadelphia. The goal was to be thought-provoking; thus,
both built and unbuilt designs are included, representing various degrees of
intervention and a wide range of design approaches. The case studies are pre-
sented in three groups according to the degree of influence that the historic
structure had on the proposal: "shells," "platforms," and "voids." The first group
comprises sites where the intervention is subordinate to history even when a
contrasting design solution was chosen. The second group presents sites where
the intervention is allowed freedom to provoke more change to the historic fab-
ric. The third group is composed of completely new buildings in historic urban
sites that have been designed in accordance with their context, such as Venturi,
Scott Brown and Associates' Franklin Court and Tod Williams Billie Tsien
Architects' Skirkanich Hall. Within the three groups are case studies with dif-
ferent design approaches ranging from shocking to subtle contrast. (A.P.A.G.)

Pickard, Rob, ed. 2001. *Management of Historic Centres*. Conservation of the
European Built Heritage Series, 2. London: Spon Press.

- This book presents 12 examples of historic European cities, each in a
different country, where the concept of integrated conservation has
been applied to the development of conservation plans for historic

neighborhoods. All case studies identify the need for some type of design control for new developments in historic urban areas. Case studies of particular interest include the following:

- Telč, Czech Republic, by Milos Drdachy: The author reports strong opposition to mandatory citywide guidelines, resulting in a compromise with recommendations that were not mandatory but strongly advised, and included characteristic local architectural elements (pp. 44–45).
- Ribe, Denmark, by Erling Sonne: The author lists the main principles that should guide a new design in order to create a continuous streetscape. Guidelines were developed to provide protection for characteristic details of the urban landscape (pp. 58–59).
- Dublin, Ireland, by Elene Negussie: The author states that new developments were encouraged to use a 'modern architectural expression', while harmonizing with the surrounding context (pp. 148–49).
- The historic center of Riga, Latvia, by Juris Dambis: The author explains some of the requirements imposed on all buildings, both new and old (pp. 194–95).
- Santiago de Compostela, Spain, by Xerardo Estevez: The author explains that the design process for new designs should include an analysis of the existing context. In this case, the city promoted appropriate design solutions by assigning new developments to prominent architects. The intent was to demonstrate in practice how new buildings could contribute positively to the enhancement of the historic fabric (pp. 228–29). (A.P.A.G.)

Also relevant for Section 2.1: Design Control Methodology and Critique.

Plant, Margaret. 2002. *Venice: Fragile City 1797–1997.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

This book covers the history of Venice from the end of the Republic under Napoleon's invasion until the attempt in 1997 to restore it. The author describes how the fall of the Campanile in 1902 helped shape the Venice approach to new constructions in the historic city. According to the author, the demise of that beloved landmark sparked an immediate public response advocating for the construction of an exact replica: "'Dov'era, com'era' became a slogan for the project in defiance of the modernists who would design it anew" (p. 235). Chapter 7 describes the reaction of architects such as Otto Wagner to this replica approach. Despite architects' protests, modernism was excluded from Venice's city center. The author writes, "The euphoric climate that saw the Campanile's regrowth made it almost impossible for a genuine appreciation of the modern to take root against the force of tradition and regional style" (p. 239). The last part of chapter 9 describes some of the designs proposed for Venice by prominent modern architects, most of which were never realized. It includes designs by Carlo Scarpa, Frank Lloyd Wright, Le Corbusier, and Louis I. Kahn. (A.P.A.G.)

Property Council of Australia. 1999. *The Design Dividend*. Sydney: Property Council of Australia.

This publication explores the idea that good urban design translates into higher economic return in development projects. The Property Council of Australia defines "good urban design" as being well connected to its surroundings, treats setting as an asset, and makes a positive contribution to its context. The publication includes Australian case studies selected based on "responsiveness to important qualities in the urban and landscape context as well as valuable historical characteristics" (p. 3). Projects that were realized in historic areas include Tyne Street Development, Carlton (p. 6); Park Hyatt Hotel, Sydney (p. 10); KPMG House, Melbourne (p. 12); East Perth Redevelopment (p. 16); Australian Technology Park, Sydney (p. 18); RMIT University, Melbourne (p. 20); and East Rundle Street, Adelaide (p. 21). (A.P.A.G.)

Quantrill, Malcolm. 1999. *The Norman Foster Studio: Consistency through Diversity*. London: E & FN Spon.

This publication discusses the philosophy and design approach of the Norman Foster studio. Quantrill provides a biography of Norman Foster highlighting likely influences that shaped him as an architect. Also included are transcripts of the author's conversations with Foster about his work, the history of his studio, and his design approach. The author also discusses roles, values, and design philosophies with Foster's five architecture partners.
The author critiques more than a dozen works (ranging from buildings to urban design projects) by the Norman Foster studio in the sections "Construct, Context and Subtext" and "The Body of Architecture." Case studies include additions to historic buildings (the Great Court, British Museum, London; Sackler Galleries, Royal Academy of Arts, London; the Reichstag, Berlin) and new architectural insertions in historic environments (Carré d'Art, Nîmes, France; Master Plan for the King's Cross Area of London; Commerzbank Headquarters, Frankfurt; Millennium Bridge, London). The design philosophy of these projects is described and illustrated with photographs, sketches, and architectural plans, and often demonstrates a thoughtful understanding of the values of place and context. (L.M.)

Scott, Keith. 1990. Designing in historic cities. *Planner* 76 (7): 23–24.

In this article, the author describes a mixed-use redevelopment project in the central area of Carlisle, UK. After an initial phase of studies and public consultation, the development team recommended that the area should be completely redeveloped to house modern commercial facilities and make it economically viable. It was also determined that the design of the new buildings would be in the character and scale of the traditional streetscape of Carlisle. In the implemented scheme, the elevations facing the city were designed in the style of the buildings that existed previously, while the elevations facing inward were designed with more freedom. The designers made use of artifices, such as broken planes on the roof and facades, to disguise the size of the buildings and maintain the small scale of the streets. (A.P.A.G.)

Ševčenko, Margaret Bentley, ed. 1983. *Adaptive Reuse: Integrating Traditional Areas into the Modern Urban Fabric: Proceedings of the Third Seminar in a Series Offered by the Continuing Education Program of the M.I.T. Laboratory of Architecture and Planning and the Harvard Graduate School of Design in Collaboration with the Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture at Harvard and M.I.T., August 16–20, 1982.* Designing in Islamic Cultures 3. Cambridge, MA: Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture.

This publication is a compilation of papers presented during the third seminar of the series "Designing in Islamic Cultures." The theme of this seminar was the adaptation of traditional urban settings to contemporary life. In part 2, "Redeveloping and Rehabilitating Traditional Urban Areas," each chapter presents an example of revitalization projects in different cities in the Middle East. One of the main challenges in these projects was to develop an approach to creating appropriate new buildings in historic cities. For example, in chapter 5, "Conservation and Redevelopment of the Kadhimiyeh Area in Baghdad," authors John Warren and Roy Worskett describe a plan proposed for an area that had been cleared in a historic neighborhood of Baghdad. The proposed design called for a contemporary architecture and street layout that were sympathetic to the local character and traditional buildings. (A.P.A.G.)

Siza, Álvaro, Carlos Castanheira, and Luís Mendes. 1997. *Álvaro Siza: The Reconstruction of the Chiado, Lisbon.* [Portugal]: ICEP - Investimentos Comércio e Turismo de Portugal.

In 1988, fire destroyed part of the Chiado historic district in Lisbon, Portugal. This book documents the design and reconstruction between 1988 and 1990 of the three city blocks of this district. The reconstruction allowed the city of Lisbon to insert new architecture in a historic environment. The designs were undertaken by Portuguese architect Álvaro Siza.
The book outlines the history of the development of Lisbon, emphasizing its character based on its urban morphology, which was ultimately retained during reconstruction. A number of considerations related to the design of the new architectural insertions in the historic environment are described, including immediate built form and context, its integration into the city (the site was in a transitional area from downtown to the hills area), existing architectural character, the opportunity to revitalize the neighborhood, and the opportunity to solve other urban issues in the area such as traffic reduction and greater integration of public transport. A holistic response to these considerations is discussed, and the book includes examples of new architectural insertions at the Chiado, including architectural drawings and thoughts on the project by the architect. (L.M.)

SPUR (San Francisco Planning and Urban Research Association). 2013. "New Life for Old Buildings." Special issue, *Urbanist* (525). http://www.spur.org/publications/urbanist/2013-07/new-life-old-buildings

This issue of the *Urbanist* was published in conjunction with an exhibition at SPUR's Urban Center, San Francisco, in 2013. The exhibition, "Adapt, Transform, Reuse," presented more than a dozen examples of historic preserva-

tion and architectural insertions in historic districts in San Francisco, and recognized that cities are built in layers: "It is the juxtaposition of old and new that gives cities their interesting corners, their urban surprises, their texture" (p. 4). Historic preservation is considered to be a tool to manage change that can serve the community with varying success.

The exhibition outlined that historic preservation uses three ways of mixing old and new: adaptive reuse (when old buildings are repurposed for a use they were not originally designed to serve), incorporation (when elements of a new building are incorporated into old buildings), and juxtaposition (when a new insertion responds to but does not mimic the old). The types of buildings illustrated in the case studies range from shopping centers, former aircraft hangers, apartment buildings, and streetscapes. (L.M.)

Venturi, Robert, and Denise Scott Brown. 2004. *Architecture as Signs and Systems: For a Mannerist Time*. William E Massey, Sr. Lectures in the History of American Civilization. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

This publication is a retrospective of the life work and theoretical underpinnings of Robert Venturi and Denise Scott Brown and is based on lectures given by the authors at Harvard University in 2003. The book comprises lengthy photo-essays on architecture and urban planning. The text emphasizes a tendency toward humane mannerist architecture for the present and future society. Concepts are discussed in context of their work, including Las Vegas and other examples that illustrate the architects' thoughts on symbolism, mannerism, patterning urban design, and communication.

Scott Brown's essays 8, "Context in Context," and 9, "Essays in Context," are of particular relevance to this bibliography. Essay 8 discusses different concepts of context and how new buildings can fit into the existing context. Essay 9 explains how several of Venturi and Scott Brown's projects attempt to engage with different contexts. Projects discussed include the Perelman Quadrangle Student Center at the University of Pennsylvania (1988–2000) and the Hôtel du Département de la Haut Garonne in Toulouse, France (1990–1999). (L.M., S.L.)